

---

**Public comment for October 1, 2025 7pm meeting**

---

From Amy O <olszewscy90@gmail.com>

Date Tue 9/30/2025 4:47 PM

To Trustees <trustees@aatwp.org>; Diane O'Connell <supervisor@aatwp.org>; Clerk <clerk@aatwp.org>

September 30, 2025

I ask that these comments be summarized and presented at the October 1, 2025 public input session and incorporated into the minutes.

Amy Olszewski  
2816 Warren Road

I am writing regarding the proposed settlement with the mine operating at 4984 Earhart Road, posted on the Township's website on September 11, 2025.

Thank you for reaching the stage where residents can see what you have been working on for the past two years. The settlement as proposed will be discussed at length on October 1st. I wished to review the terms of the Motion For Temporary Restraining Order And Preliminary Injunction as submitted by Nathan Dupes on behalf of the Township on September 23, 2023. In the Township's brief in September 2023, there are multiple items cited, and the table below lists the items as I understand them today, along with terms of settlement to address the items contained in the original motion.

As outlined below, the settlement shared with residents is unacceptable in its current form:

1. It does not cover the items listed in the original motion.
2. It does not provide concrete, enforceable actions or triggers that would lead to enforcement.
3. It is implemented prior to resolution of state violations, which is against Township precedent.
4. It does not contain monetary damages or relief.
5. It speaks to reclamation plans not approved by the community and submitted settlement materials rely on a proven flawed hydrogeologic study.
6. It allows the mine to operate under these vague assertions with no enforceability and sets the community up for a mine leaving their mess on our doorstep and walking away.

It was made clear that this is only a draft settlement and it is my expectation that these and other citizen comments will provide you with evidence as you negotiate that we are tired of being treated like fools and that vague terms with multiple meanings are not acceptable. The mine's behaviors cannot continue as is. Please reference our comments when speaking to the MMM lawyers - we are providing you more than adequate support to negotiate absolute and concrete terms for your citizens of our Township.

<b>VIOLATION CITED IN MOTION (in the order they appear)</b>	<b>PROPOSED SETTLEMENT TERMS</b>
Dewatering/Excessive use of groundwater	<ol style="list-style-type: none"><li>1. Addresses that there will not be dewatering in the future</li><li>2. <u>Does not address excessive use of groundwater in the creation of large lakes which will hold upwards of 500k - 1M gallons of fresh water.</u></li></ol>

	<p>3. <u>Does not address poor water quality /aquifer damage due to mining</u></p> <p>4. <u>Does not address any damages due to dewatering</u> The profits made off of dewatering and other practices were large for MMM. No monetary damages are provided for in this settlement to deter illegal practices.</p>
<p>Trucks, which have operated outside of permitted hours and caused excessive noise, vibration, and dust</p>	<p>1. Addresses hours of operation.</p> <p><u>Re: Hours of operation - Does not address</u> when Township would take enforcement action should this be violated.</p> <p>2. Addresses Noise of truck traffic</p> <p><u>RE: Noise and truck counts: Does not address noise exceedances from the process of <i>mining itself</i></u> (only mine traffic noise), which we know mining noise on the North edge of the mine is already disturbing residents and students at the elementary school.</p> <p><u>The referenced 30-day period for addressing noise complaints is vague.</u> The mine is famous for saying "it's that one time and it will never happen again". We could experience multiple incidences of noise, unaddressed, over a period of time with no Township action, with MMM simply stating "we're working on it".</p> <p>3. Addresses Truck queuing (staging) and mentions enforcement as the Township "could" seek enforcement. Should be changed to "shall".</p> <p>4. Addresses truck count, establishing that MMM need only provide weekly averages, rather than daily counts to the Township. Daily counts are much more important than averages as is seen below. Remember, Truck Counts equal TWO trips - to the mine and from the mine. At 80 trucks permitted - 160 trips - that's a truck every 5 minutes max on Earhart.</p> <p><u>This does not address the days they are over daily truck count, as the township only receives weekly averages.</u> The township should demand daily truck counts not allow weekly (average) truck counts.</p> <p><u>Does not seek damages</u> for days MMM was over daily truck count of 80. In a very cursory perusal of the data provided on the Township website:</p>

	<p>2024: At least two instances of truck counts over 80. Approx 25% of truck traffic was above 50.</p> <p>2023: At least seven instances of truck counts over 80. Most notably, February had one day with 135 trucks (A truck passing every two minutes). Approx 50% of the days had truck counts above 50 (before the injunction passed).</p> <p>2022: At least five instances of truck counts over 80. Approx 50% of truck traffic Summer - December was over 50/day.</p> <p>5. <u>Does not address dust or vibrations.</u></p>
<p>Section 74-136(2) requires a conditional use to be compatible with the natural environment and existing and future land uses in the vicinity.</p>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. <u>Settlement does not address</u> any relief, mitigation or damages for the purposeful and complete destruction of the protected wetlands or does it address the damage to Massey Lake.</li> <li>2. <u>Settlement does not address</u> damage to adjoining property values due to the destruction of the natural environment.</li> <li>3. <u>Settlement does not address</u> current poor water quality issues caused by mining practices.</li> </ol>
<p>Section 74-136(5) requires that a conditional use not be detrimental, hazardous, or disturbing to existing or future neighboring uses, persons, property or the public welfare.</p>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Settlement addresses mine traffic noise. <u>Does not address</u> mining noise.</li> <li>2. <u>Settlement does not address</u> dust damage and health effects from unmitigated dust. <u>Does not require</u> for a regular watering of Earhart Road and/or the mine (for example, a trigger such as XX number of days without rain with temperatures over XX degrees.)</li> <li>3. <u>Settlement does not address</u> damage to environment and any hazards related to this damage.</li> </ol>
<p>Section 74-592(c)(7) prohibits mining operations from altering the drainage pattern of surface or subsurface waters on adjacent property.</p>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. <u>Settlement does not address</u> this issue. There is a vague, uncommitted statement:  MMM would consider other reasonable assurances in the consent judgment to ensure the health of the lake and protections for the aquifer.</li> <li>2. <u>This statement in the settlement does not adequately nor directly address the following known issues:</u></li> </ol>

	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Health of the aquifer. No accepted study has been produced to gauge the health of the aquifer. Thus, speaking to protections is vague.</li> <li>2. Water quality is proven to be poor surrounding and down-aquifer from the mine. The non-promise of “considering other reasonable assurances” is a no-go.</li> <li>3. No damages listed for the 2023 and current destruction of the surface and subsurface waters.</li> <li>4. No damages listed for failure of berms and vegetations to control drainage to adjacent properties.</li> </ol>
<p>Section 74-592(c)(10)(f) requires the site plan to include “location and nature of structures and stationary equipment to be located on site during mining operations.”</p>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. <u>Settlement does not address this</u> nor are there any damages included in the settlement for blatantly disregarding the site plan on numerous occasions, even up to present day. This settlement supports MMM’s egregious behavior of doing first and asking permission only when caught.</li> <li>2. <u>Settlement does not contain damages from past violations.</u> The dewatering, equipment deliveries over the past five years, creation of an outfall pipe, creation of different haul paths within the mine, continued creation of illegal lakes are all examples of violations of required site plan change notifications.</li> <li>3. <u>Settlement does not address future site plan changes.</u> If site plan changes occur without proper Township notification, there should be a requirement that should MMM enact site plan changes without notification to the Township, the Township will immediately seek enforcement.</li> </ol>
<p>Section 74-592(c)(10)(m) requires that the site plan must have a certified statement by an engineer concerning the expected impact on the water table and water supply wells in the vicinity of the site.</p>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. <u>No reliable study provided.</u> As EGLE has pointed out in various memos, the study submitted regarding the proposed 60-acre reclamation lake contains incorrect data, flawed hypotheses and any conclusions cannot be used by MMM</li> </ol>

<p>Added wording in settlement mentions reclamation lake</p>	<p>or the township regarding water table, water supply, affect the reclamation lake would have on this or the health of the lake/aquifer.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>2. <u>EGLE has not approved permit or Part 301 violation mitigations.</u> Settlement cannot occur until both Part 301, 303 and any other outstanding violations addressed with state.</li> <li>3. <u>Inclusion of reclamation lake without public input</u> as is seen in materials attached to the settlement is misleading the public. Approval of the settlement and the current Part 301 application, by default, approves one 60-acre lake on the property. There would then be limited discussion of any reclamation plans with the public as promised and it reduces public input from a robust discussion of four possible reclamation plans to one option with a lake larger than any plan yet submitted.</li> <li>4. <u>Settlement does not include</u> monetary damages for damage to the environment or creation of a greater than 5 acre lake as outlined in the CUP.</li> </ol>
<p>Section 74-175 requires that a preliminary site plan must identify any on-site or adjacent natural features, including wetlands, it must provide a Natural Resources Impact Statement and must also provide a site analysis describing the site's relationship to natural features.</p>	<p>see comments directly above. Also, no Natural Resources Impact Statement, or even a current natural resource condition review.</p>
<p>Section 74-594 generally prohibits any use that creates any "dangerous, injurious, noxious, or otherwise objectionable element or condition so as to adversely affect the surrounding area or adjoining premises."</p>	<p>As outlined above, <u>settlement does not</u> adequately address water quality, dust, noise, environmental damage either by omission or by having vague, undefined enforcement and consequences of continued unacceptable behaviors.</p>
<p>EGLE's Violation Notice, which apparently remains unresolved, states that Defendants' operations have violated numerous provisions of state environmental law, resulting in adverse impacts to wetlands, streams, and lake.</p>	<p><u>Settlement is against Township precedent.</u> There is a precedent in the Township of not accepting any project proposals without other governmental entity signoff. All projects are reminded that paperwork must be completed and proof submitted prior to final Board of Trustee approvals. In this instance, MMM is still in violation of numerous state regulations. They should not be allowed to settle until those state violations are resolved.</p>
<p>Items not in motion, but added to the settlement.</p>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. MMM would provide additional sand at the intersection of Warren and Earhart to address icy conditions, with the consent of the Road Commission, or alternatively, would work with the Road</li> </ol>

	<p>Commission to address safety concerns at the intersection.</p> <p>2. MMM would submit an annually updated road escrow fund to pay for ongoing maintenance in an amount determined by the Road Commission and that also would include replacement of gravel and/or limestone at least every two years, or more often if recommended by the Road Commission.</p>
<p>Added to settlement Well mitigation</p>	<p>wording in settlement: MMM would continue to mitigate any impacts to the neighboring wells.</p> <p><b>As Alice said at Mad Hatter’s tea party, you cannot have more tea if you’ve never been offered anything so far.</b></p> <p>MMM has not mitigated impacts to wells. They have thrown money to only those residents they felt ‘deserved’ it, based on multiple flawed, one may say, purposely misleading studies (after all, when you include wells not even located in the area to prove low impact, that is outright fraudulent).</p> <p>This statement in the settlement is especially frustrating, as it is completely vague, unenforceable and misleading. Neither the township nor MMM have visited the homes affected with low water quality. Nothing is mitigated. We have borne the costs of filtration systems, bringing potable water jugs to our houses, worry and stress.</p>

Apologizes for formatting errors caused by email submission.

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of Ann Arbor Charter Township. DO NOT click on links or open attachments unless you were expecting the email, recognize the sender, and know the content is safe.

---

## Stakeholder's input regarding operations at the Vella Pit

---

From ANITA HALPRIN <anitahalprin@comcast.net>

Date Wed 10/1/2025 6:16 AM

To Trustees <trustees@aatwp.org>; Diane O'Connell <supervisor@aatwp.org>; Clerk <clerk@aatwp.org>

 5 attachments (472 KB)

1.5 to 2 month used filter v new filter.pdf; black grit from filter container on paper towel.pdf; inside of filter container after black filter removed.pdf; grit in sink and on hands after removing filter (looks like soot).pdf; One of 4 double load trucks on Joy Rd btwn 12-1230 pm 8-13-25.pdf;

Dear Ann Arbor Township Trustees,

Unfortunately, I am out of the country and unable to attend tonight's meeting of the Ann Arbor Township Board of Trustees to speak in person, however, please know that I fully support the statements of my neighbors in attendance. I am very fortunate to have knowledgeable neighbors who have devoted much of their personal time and energy in the last few years to perform extensive research and study the facts surrounding the operation of the Vella pits and the impact it has, and will continue to have, on our community.

Amy Olszewski and Ingrid Wiemer, just to name two, have written to you in the last few days with detailed information. Their statements are factual, concise and thorough, and express the concerns we all share regarding the current conditions of our wells, our wildlife, our safety and our property values, as well as the future outcomes, which can only be much worse if the abuse of our surroundings is not stopped now.

While you've heard the facts from my neighbors, my appeal is more emotional (see my 9/11/25 message below), because in addition to all the physical, financial and environmental ways MMM's operations affect us, I feel that they hurt us on an emotional level as well.

Let me close by asking you to review my 9/11 correspondence, especially the photographs of the black water filter, and ask yourselves if you would want to drink the water that has run through that filter.

Thank you again for your time and attention to this issue.

Sincerely,  
Anita Halprin  
3323 E. Joy Rd.  
(248) 622-7909

----- Original Message -----

From: ANITA HALPRIN <anitahalprin@comcast.net>

To: "trustees@aatwp.org" <trustees@aatwp.org>, "clerk@aatwp.org" <clerk@aatwp.org>, "sshink@senate.michigan.gov" <sshink@senate.michigan.gov>, "jennifer@conlinforstaterep.com" <jennifer@conlinforstaterep.com>,

"boardmembers@northfieldmi.gov" <boardmembers@northfieldmi.gov>, "EGLE-Info@Michigan.gov" <EGLE-Info@Michigan.gov>, "wrcr@wcroads.org" <wrcr@wcroads.org>

Date: 09/11/2025 7:58 PM EDT

Subject: Operations at MMM Vella Pit & the Effect on Everyone and Everything Around It

To All Concerned with the Operations at MMM Vella Pit (EGLE, Ann Arbor Twp., Northfield Twp., Washtenaw County Road Commission, our State Legislators):

My name is Anita Halprin. I live at 3323 E. Joy Rd. While I live in Northfield Twp., I'm just across the road from Ann Arbor Twp., and just about a mile away from the MMM Vella gravel pit. I searched for ten years for my "retirement" home before I found 3323 (also known as "The Croft") and bought it in February 2019. MMM hadn't purchased the small gravel pit at that time. I moved in in June 2020.

The first thing I noticed was the heavy truck traffic past my house. The noise and the dust were disconcerting. Several months later I noticed that my water had developed a nasty smell. I noticed it first while brushing my teeth, then it gradually became more noticeable in other areas (I can now smell it on my laundered clothes, even if I use a scented detergent to try to mask the odor). I started carting home gallons of bottled water from the grocery store, as I became increasingly concerned about drinking or cooking with the water from my tap.

Smelly water seemed like a minor concern, though, when I learned that my neighbors' wells were drying up. I listened to MMM's representatives claim they wanted to be "good neighbors" and make false promises at a meeting of the Ann Arbor Twp. Board.

MMM replaced dried up wells, but I wondered what my neighbors had had to endure in the meantime, and how was this even allowed to happen in the first place?! What mining operations were occurring on such a large scale as to suck up everyone's water in this bucolic residential area? We're talking about WATER here. Clean, safe water is imperative to LIFE.

Then last March, I went to change my water filter and found it BLACK. (Please see photos attached.) It's not just me. Neighbors have shared photos and stories of brown water flowing from their faucets, slimy discolored water filters, and odors that require that they open their windows, even on chilly days. But I'm sure you've heard about all of this. My question is - How is the mine allowed to affect our health, our environment, and even our finances? Why has this not been stopped by the people we rely on to safeguard our interests?

And I haven't even mentioned the pollution of Massey Lake and Fleming Creek and the impact on the wildlife in the area!

This is the home I saved for and searched for so that I could enjoy my retirement years in peace, surrounded by nature. I want to sit on my porch and watch the deer and turkeys wander through my yard and the joggers, dog walkers and nuns on bicycles enjoying the rural beauty on Joy Road. I want to listen to the tree frogs and watch the fireflies. If MMM is allowed to continue operating as they are now, we will all lose so much!

What will another 6 years of pillage and abuse leave us with?

To those of you in positions of authority, please do not turn a blind eye to illegal activities and a blatant disregard for the law, please don't be swayed by the misinformation MMM provides. Please don't accept what they say without question. Please confirm their reports, test their assertions, protect the residents surrounding the gravel pit and beyond. Please acknowledge that people, families, wildlife and nature are more important than corporate greed. This is your community and we rely on you. Please stop MMM from making our environment unsafe for families and wildlife and from taking away what is rightfully ours.

Thank you for your time and effort on our behalf.

Sincerely,  
*Anita Halprin*

P.S. The double-load trucks that are not permitted on Joy Road still kick up dust on a regular basis. Here is a photo of one of four such trucks I saw while sitting on my front porch for only 30 minutes between around 12 and 12:30 p.m. on August 13<sup>th</sup>.

P.P.S. Also, while I'm not an authority on this situation, I am one of many affected by it and would be glad to discuss the impact it has on me personally. I can be reached at (248)622-7909, 3323 E. Joy Rd., Ann Arbor, MI 48105, or [anitahalprin@comcast.net](mailto:anitahalprin@comcast.net).

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of Ann Arbor Charter Township. DO NOT click on links or open attachments unless you were expecting the email, recognize the sender, and know the content is safe.

 Outlook

---

## Approve of proposed settlement with MMM Vella Pit

---

**From** Rena Basch <rena.h.basch@gmail.com>

**Date** Wed 10/1/2025 3:02 PM

**To** Trustees <trustees@aatwp.org>

**Cc** Diane O'Connell <supervisor@aatwp.org>; Carlene Colvin-Garcia <treasurer@aatwp.org>; Clerk <clerk@aatwp.org>

Hello Township Trustees,

I am unable to attend this evening's public input session, but wanted to express my strong support for the proposed settlement with MMM regarding the Vella Pit. It is a huge win for those of us on residential wells if a consent judgement means that there will be NO dewatering ever again at this site. It is also in my opinion a huge win for protecting groundwater.

As a taxpayer, I also really appreciate this settlement path. Michigan state law on mineral mining is such that it would have been a fruitless exercise and an extraordinary waste of taxpayer money to continue or initiate further litigation against this mine. Dewatering remains a legal mining practice until something changes in state law.

All of the 10 possible/proposed conditions of the settlement posted on the township website sound reasonable, and address community and environmental concerns. Thank you for your work to get us to this advantageous position; and thank you for listening to the subject matter experts, legal and scientific, over these past few years.

Best regards,

Rena Basch

4260 Shetland Dr.

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of Ann Arbor Charter Township. DO NOT click on links or open attachments unless you were expecting the email, recognize the sender, and know the content is safe.

My name is Howard Bockbrader and my wife and I live at 2749 Trailwood Ln. Trailwood Ln is off of Nixon and just south of Warren Rd and a little more than 1.5 miles southwest of the gravel pit.

I want to speak about the condition of our well.

On Jan 28, 2023, our well went dry. Cribley lowered our pump ~10' and the well was functioning again.

On April 7, 2023, our well went dry again and we had to have a new well installed at a cost of over \$10K.

I learned in July about the dewatering at the mine and EGLE told me to contact the mine and they would reimburse us for the new well. I contacted the mine and was told they would not reimburse me for the new well since their model indicated our well was outside the range that would be impacted. He also speculated that other factors such as farming and new homes in the area were the cause of my well problems. These assumptions are false based on well record data for recent wells drilled near our home.

The next day I received a phone call from news service asking if I would be willing to be interviewed concerning the condition of my well. Less than 20 minutes later I received a call from a lawyer representing the mine saying that they didn't believe they were the cause of my well going dry but as a 'GOOD NEIGHBOR' they would reimburse us for the new well.

So how is our new well doing? So far we have had no issues with the well going dry.

The new issue is increased sediment in the well water. In 2011 I had a Kinetico iron and water softener system installed. In 2021 the system began to fail and the service rep felt the resins were being coated with sediment causing the iron in the water and increasing the hardness and a new system was installed. On 8/5/25 the water softener stopped working. The service rep had to replace the water softener at a cost of just under \$6K due to sediment buildup. The life of our water softener was cut into 1/2 since the mine started operating.

First it was the well going dry, next increased sediment in the water, what's next? It is becoming expensive to live near our Good Neighbor. We know the mine's actions shows they have no regard for township's natural resources. As township trustees, you must protect our natural resources both above and below the ground or they will be lost to current and future residents.

With regards to item 10 of the settlement, this section needs to be very specific.

- Who receives the benefit? Only people who's well went dry, a certain miles from well (we know issues have been seen over 3 miles away from the mine), or all individuals in the township.
- What is covered? Only wells being replaced or entire components of the well including expansion tank, any filters, iron filter tank, water softener etc. People are experiencing increased sediment being brought up from the well. The life expectancy of our water softener was cut in 1/2 since the mine started dewatering. What about properties now are experiencing higher than normal water levels?
- When or how long does the coverage last? We live 1.5 miles southwest of the mine. In 1985, running our well for 2 hrs lowered the static water level 3 feet, a well drilled in 6/2020 just a ¼ mile from us and drilled to nearly the same depth showed only a 5 foot drop after 1 hr of pumping, our new well drilled in 4/2023 showed a 25 foot drop in the static water level after 1 hour of pumping. Recently it was shown at our neighbor's well that the water table only increased ~1.5 feet. Since residents near the mine are experiencing higher than normal water levels, we are concerned that the aquafer running underground towards the homes near Trailwood Lane has been damaged. In the future our wells may never recover and/or go dry. Will there be funds for our wells if they go dry in 5 or 10 years due to damage to the aquafer flowing southwest from the mine?

On Wednesday, October 8, 2025 at 01:58:28 PM EDT, Chris Cruz  
<christopher.i.cruz@gmail.com> wrote:

To the Trustees of the Ann Arbor Township,

My name is Chris Cruz and I live in Ann Arbor township. I live 2 miles from MMM's Vella Pit and have lived here for six years.

I want to share how my well has been impacted, on why the proposed settlement terms do not protect our residents, and my thoughts regarding MMM's practices

Our well was installed on 6/27/19 and is 101 feet deep. The static water level on 6/27/19 was 30 feet. We tested our well depth on 8/9/23 and the static water level was now 39.5 feet. In four years, we lost about 10 feet of water for the pump to access. Our EGLE-approved well representative said it's "normal" for wells to drop 1-2 feet a year and "alarming" to drop 6-7+ feet. We remain concerned b/c we are losing well depth at an above average pace.

Now, we have the power and opportunity to settle the lawsuit on our terms in a way that benefits the Township and its residents. It seems like we are settling to MMM, and not vice versa. Rather, we should consider this settlement an invitation to ask for what we want and build in contingencies for when, not if, MMM continues its pattern of doing whatever it wants in the next 6 years. And as an aside, their proposed 6-year window is likely related only to MMM's strategic plans to abandon mining here at that point anyway, so it is not really a concession of any sort. The township homeowners do not want to spend the next six years preoccupied with this. The settlement agreement must give more monetary coverage to homeowners. I respectfully request that you take this into consideration when negotiating with MMM.

Furthermore, if township residents have to dig deeper wells, the deeper aquifer may contain arsenic and other toxins, compromising the reliability and safety of the water supply.

MMM should immediately cease dewatering. Water levels need to recover to pre-MMM levels.

I was unable to attend last week's township meeting about this, but I heard that the comments were not recorded, which is disappointing as the township people's comments were likely not entirely included into the public record.

Do you live in the township? Are you not concerned about your water well?

Please listen to your residents and change course in your desire to reach a settlement with the current terms from MMM, which right now seems insufficient and does not really advocate for the citizens of the township and your constituents.

Thank you,

-Christopher Cruz

I am Louisa Self at 2443 Westbrooke Cir N, Ann Arbor, Northbrooke South Subdivision. We are located less than 1 ½ miles from MMM, as the crow flies. I am President of the HOA and speaking on behalf of myself and many neighbors.

Many of us have had our well water levels measured and have seen a drop in the water level although we are not close to the mine. Our home alone was tested in 2023 and had lost 2 feet in just a couple of years. Homes very close by have lost their wells. The township should be concerned about taking care of the resident taxpayers in the community and protecting them from businesses who operate in ways that negatively impact the community. Digging new, deeper wells is not the solution due to increased toxins at deeper levels and the water is still being replenished too rapidly for long term viability.

Homeowners have suffered from wells losing water and going dry, possible toxins in the water, and the impact of MMM being allowed to run a business without following rules. EGLE has confirmed that the operator has been providing information based upon an inaccurate model. The mine has expanded, at times unpermitted, and continued to adversely affect the water supply. Residents have been impacted by falling property values projected to be in the 5-30% range.

The 2020 CUP application stated inaccurate information: “The proposed use is consistent with the current use and past use for several decades,” and **“being consistent with decades of use, the proposed use will preserve and not negatively impact property values.”**

The settlement should not allow MMM to continue to operate for 6-8 more years without major modifications to how they operate and treat their neighbors. The monetary settlement should pay property owners for depreciation, well disruptions, extremes in water levels, and toxins, etc. The township should demand a substantial escrow amount for reclamation. MMM operations should be stopped until a plan can be developed to operate in a way to coexist peacefully in the community.

Township trustees, please listen to your residents.

I am speaking today to my experience with years of living under a Communist government, and my disappointment when I saw the incompetence, hypocrisy, and lack of transparency at any level of national and local governance. It is a shock to see it again in my new country, in our own backyard.

Growing up in Poland before 1989 you could not trust what the government told you. Misinformation and lies and half-truths were normal.

When I became a US citizen, I was glad I could depend on the government to do what was the will of the people and not their own self-interest.

But what we have experienced in this township for the last four years is not new to me?

- a lack of respect for citizen input
- Released Documents that knowingly contain false information, such as the settlement hydrogeologic report, the truck traffic spreadsheets with conflicting data, and the incomplete settlement terms
- Dismissal and downplaying of citizen testimony, even when it is supported by state agency experts
- Overt bullying by a corporation of an entire community, which To This Day has not been stopped by my government, to whom we pay our taxes
- A severe degradation of our quality of life on my property, including water quality worse than two years ago

Will you fight for me and these people in this room?

You should not be afraid. We have truth on our side.

Stop supporting the lies and half-truths of this corporate monster.

Support the people you serve.

**If you believe this exceeds your competencies, please step down** and let the competent people to take care of our township living conditions, including the environmental safety of our water and air, health and beauty of our environment, value of our properties, and putting a STOP to the everyday nuisance of a company operating in our backyards.

Regarding the settlement, my wife, Amy, holding an MS in Public Administration and Finance, submitted our complete analysis of the terms as presented and compared them with the original lawsuit. There are great omissions, monetary damages unaddressed and no concrete enforcement and subsequent consequences for lack of compliance. A lot of work still needs to be done. I hope negotiations are strengthened by all the comments today.

The Board should rely on her professional analysis and the resultant demands and feel very supported to be tougher in negotiations and if necessary, appoint more competent lawyers.

## Special Township Meeting 10/1

Comments: Susan Minard

4125 Earhart Road

Trustees, I ask you to please help us understand why the township continues to bend over backwards to accommodate this mining conglomerate that has numerous times broken the terms set forth in their conditional use permit which has resulted in very serious consequences for our community? Why do this for a company that has devastated our natural resources, drastically reduced the safety and quality of life for residents and put the learning of school age children at risk? Why do this when your residents have made it very clear that we have suffered very serious consequences as a result of this mining operation? It makes absolutely no ethical sense. I am not alone when I say that I am absolutely bewildered by this pattern and I am weary.

First and foremost, we need the Board of Trustees to NOT propose settlement items that are based on a hydrological report commissioned by MMM that has been rejected by EGLE. PAUSE any talk of settlement and commission an independent valid hydrological report BEFORE putting forth settlement terms.

The era of vague reassurances to residents from the township and trusting MMM to follow the rules needs to end NOW. Any and all settlement terms MUST include clear and objective rules and consequences for violations. All settlement items MUST be monitored and enforced by the township. If the township does not have the appropriate and qualified staffing to do so but is going to allow MMM to operate in Ann Arbor Township, you MUST hire people who can. It is not the responsibility of tax paying citizens to do the work the township cannot or will not do. Yet that is exactly what we have had to do. It was Hollis Dayton and Tanya Whalen who first recognized the need to better understand how many wells were being impacted and we initiated a plan to reach out and connect neighbors. From that first initiative, the scope of the issue was discovered and

numerous neighbors since have come together to support and advocate for this community. Michael Watts and Amy O. have dedicated innumerable hours and resources to protecting this community. Kay and I are grateful for them and for all of our neighbors. This community of good people have done this work - your work - because it has needed to be done. We love our homes and we work hard to be good stewards of our land. We care for our neighbors, our natural resources, our way of life. But here is the thing: we all have lives to tend to beyond monitoring this mining operation and advocating for justice. The compliance of this mining operation is YOUR responsibility to manage, not ours.

I am a social worker at one of the largest middle schools in Michigan. We work hard at my school to teach our children how to be an upstander. If you are not familiar with the term, an upstander is a person who comes to the aid of another when they are being harmed by someone. Board of Trustees, we need you to be our upstander. This community has cooperated, pleaded and reasoned with you. This is your moment to right the wrongs that have been done to this community, to our natural resources and to the future residents of Ann Arbor Township.

I close with a quote from Nelson Mandela:

“It always seems impossible until it’s done.”



**Ann Arbor Township  
MMM Public Input Session  
October 1, 2025**

It is a little frustrating that the community is being asked to provide comment on proposed settlement terms and there are apparently more terms and conditions which may directly influence the nature of our comments.

This Township has consistently held that applicants must have all outside agency reviews and approvals before they will even be placed on the agenda. MMM does not have the required EGLE permits to operate. Any settlement should not occur until all outstanding violations with EGLE are resolved and cured and all permits have been properly approved.

They submitted a hydrogeological study that was deemed inaccurate and lacking, so any settlement at this time puts the aquifer at an unacceptable risk.

This agreement allows them to operate until the end of 2031 – 6 ½ years past when their initial permit expired. Any settlement should be consistent with the mining ordinance’s 5-year renewal, which should require termination of operations in the summer of 2030, at latest.

This Settlement does not address any penalties (financial or otherwise) for past violations and what the penalties will be for future violations.

All reclamation funds should be secured with a performance guarantee for the full cost of restoring the land and the Township’s typical 3-year monitoring. This is likely tens of thousands per acre. An independent, third party should review the costs to restore, revegetate and reforest the property. The reclamation plan needs to be approved and the cost determined before a settlement, not “...on a future date yet to be negotiated...”

Any settlement should include a required monthly road maintenance escrow for the duration of MMM's operations, not just gravel and limestone "at least every two years".

All monitoring for noise needs to be independently conducted with information shared directly with residents via live reporting on the Township website. Violations need to be immediately addressed with up to and including suspension of operations.

In sense from our neighbors, no one is interested in MMM having the right to take "reasonable efforts," their blatant disregard for the health, safety and welfare of this community requires clearly articulated enforcement requirements in any settlement.

The devastation to our community that the industrial scale mining of MMM has caused since their arrival (adversely impacting the aquifer with the resulting damage to wells, illegal discharges to protected wetlands and the downstream impact of the contamination of Massey Lake to the point it can barely sustain aquatic life, degradation of roads, decline in the quality life of neighbors from noise, dust and other nuisances) demands settlement terms that are fully in the interests of the residents and tax paying property owners of this community – not the entity causing these problems.

John J. Petz  
Director of Real Estate & Public Affairs  
Domino's Farms Corporation  
24 Frank Lloyd Wright Drive  
Ann Arbor, MI 48106

## TOWNSHIP COMMENTS 9-30-25

R. Kunkel

Tonight I have several questions, that I hope you will answer. First I want you to know that last month we have had to replace three faucets in our house as they were almost clogged shut and the water flow was at a trickle. This was not a planned remodel. We also had to replace the water pressure tank bladder in hopes that it would help with increasing our water pressure. So our household has on going water quality issues.

Now my questions regarding the “settlement”.

1. What does “enforceable consent judgement” mean? Are there fines, penalties, mine closures, if agreement conditions are not met? These MUST be clearly stated. Saying that the township “could take enforcement action” does not engender confidence. The mine has deep pockets, small fines are meaningless. How will the mining operations be monitored? This is critical. How will infraction reporting be handled? In the past it has basically fallen on the community to be the reporters of problems.
2. WHY give them 6 years of further mining without another CUP? Is it in our best .interests, or the mines? Is it because according to the Michigan Compiled Laws the statue of limitations is 6 years to recover natural resources damages? They can get off scott free from damages they have inflicted now. This is unacceptable.
3. Who approves the final plans and the final work done to reclaim the mine site at the end of 6 years? If approved by EGLE, is the 60 acre lake a done deal for the final reclamation plan? I for one do not support it,
4. Doesn't WSG Properties (which is Dan's and Ajax) own the land the mine is on, and they just lease it to MMM? At the end of 6 years what is to stop WSG from leasing the mining rights to another shell company and continue industrial level mining. THIS IS A HUGE RED FLAG FOR ME. Is it basically WSG's call on how the property will be used at the end of 6 years? Are there ANY limitations on its future usage? Could the township recover the property as part of the conditions for a settlement and build something for the good of the entire township- hiking trails, picnic area, or a park. After 6 years would a new mine be able to dewater? Would we be back at square one after 6 years?
5. What will be done to rehab the wetlands and Massey Lake from the damage that MMM has done already? The township's ordinances say that wetlands must be restored or if not possible new wetlands must be installed at 1.5X the original size. This should be included in the settlement. Residents are held to this standard, the mine should be also.
6. Since MMM's hydrogeological comprehensive plan was found by EGLE to contain errors and using a flawed model, will the township require them to submit a new hydrogeology report, and have it evaluated by an expert?

In closing I would just say, that speaking for my family, as you go forward negotiating the settlement, we do NOT want things that stress the aquifer, the environment and the residents in this community.

**Statement for Public input session on issues related to the Mid-Michigan Materials Vella Pit Board of Trustees Special Meeting, October 1<sup>st</sup>, 2025, 7:00pm**

**Submitted by Sr. Elizabeth Ann O'Reilly, OP**

Dominican Sisters of Mary, Mother of the Eucharist  
4597 Warren Road, Ann Arbor Township

- My name is Sr. Elizabeth Ann O'Reilly, and I also serve on the General Council of the Dominican Sisters of Mary, Mother of the Eucharist, located at 4597 Warren Road, as well the board of Spiritus Sanctus Academy.
- As a Dominican Sister, I am an educator. For the past nine years, I taught students at Father Gabriel Richard high school. In doing so, I stressed to them the importance of participating in public life.
- While they should contribute to the common good primarily by fulfilling their personal responsibilities, they also must build up the common good through activities such as voting, paying taxes and respecting those in authority.
- I also taught them about the responsibilities of those in public office. Those in authority serve the common good by promoting respect for the dignity of the human person and ensuring justice and stability by protecting the rights of all.
- Social justice is achieved when citizens and those in authority work together to ensure what is needed is provided so that all can reach their fulfilment as a group or individually.
- Thus, it saddens me to find an example of injustice in our own community due to the actions of a mine that cannot be trusted and shows little regard for other property owners.
- Accordingly, we have placed our trust in Ann Arbor township, and you board members, to do the right thing: specifically, to bring the mine into full compliance with its legal and monetary obligations.
- We know you agree with this objective. Otherwise, the township would not have filed the lawsuit against the mine in the first place.
- Therefore, you must ensure that the settlement agreement holds the mine accountable for the environment, requires firm adherence to any enforceable consent judgment, and provides monetary compensation to any harmed property owners.
- The township has had two years to uphold the trust we have placed in you. The time to act more forcefully in defense of property owners is now through an iron-clad settlement agreement which holds the mine accountable now and for years to come.

**Statement for Public input session on issues related to the Mid-Michigan Materials Vella Pit  
Board of Trustees Special Meeting, October 1<sup>st</sup>, 2025, 7:00pm  
Submitted by Sr. Louis Marie Zogg, OP**

Dominican Sisters of Mary, Mother of the Eucharist  
4597 Warren Road, Ann Arbor Township

- My name is Sr. Louis Marie Zogg, and I serve on the General Council of the Dominican Sisters of Mary, Mother of the Eucharist located at 4597 Warren Road.
- In addition to my role in helping to govern our community, I serve on the board of Spiritus Sanctus Academy (SSA), situated across from the Vella Pit at 4101 E. Joy Road. I also hold the position of Novice Mistress, overseeing the formation of our newest Sisters.
- These responsibilities connect me deeply to the lives of our Sisters, as well as the students and staff at our schools and other entities.
- Our presence here matters. We've been good neighbors, visible and respectful. And now, with growing concerns about the mine, we feel a responsibility to speak up yet again!
- Specifically, we remain concerned that rising water levels in some wells (including ours), the lack of recovery in others, and recently documented water quality issues at many properties are just a different and continuing manifestation of a damaged aquifer.
- We have noticed changes in smell and taste to our water. This raises real questions in our minds about its safety. To what can you attribute these changes? How do we know the water is safe?
- It further raises questions as to whether all steps have been taken to investigate water safety? Have you communicated regularly with EGLE? How do your and their areas of responsibility intersect to protect property owners' interests?
- We're not only concerned about its safety today but also in the future. Has the aquifer been damaged irreparably? Can we be assured that it is in acceptable condition not only now, but for years to come?
- I ask these questions because as Sr. Joseph Andrew noted our community is not leaving. We are responsible for both current and future Sisters, students, and their families.
- The solution is actually quite simple: only competent third-party hydrogeological professionals with no attachment to the mine can answer these questions and provide us with the certainty that is our right and your responsibility.

**Statement for Public input session on issues related to the Mid-Michigan Materials/Vella Pit Board of Trustees Special Meeting, October 1, 2025, 7:00pm**

**Submitted by Sr. Maria Gemma Martek, OP**

Dominican Sisters of Mary, Mother of the Eucharist  
4597 Warren Road, Ann Arbor Township

- My name is Sister Maria Gemma Martek; I am a member of the Dominican Sisters of Mary, Mother of the Eucharist located at 4597 Warren Rd. I am also the former principal of Spiritus Sanctus Academy (4101 E. Joy Rd.). I currently work at our audio/visual educational studio adjacent to the school at 4225 E. Joy Rd., directly opposite the MMM Vella Gravel Pit on the north side of Joy Road.
- I am appearing today to emphasize that Mid Michigan Material's operations have created a serious, ongoing, and public health concern affecting our students, teachers and staff.
- Our school and educational studio are in closer proximity to the mine than any other single property.
- The noise emanating from mine and truck traffic activities has disrupted our ability to provide our students with a quality and peaceful learning environment, potentially increasing the risk of immediate and long-term learning and developmental issues.
- The children entrusted to us and their teachers face noise disruption continuously throughout the school day, from the time they arrive until the time they depart.
- Research demonstrates that noise levels above 60-65 dB can significantly impair learning, yet the noise level range of the mine's activities can reach, and has reached, as high as 70-80 dB.
- As educators, we know that noise may have any of the following significant impacts on a child's learning, attention and focus, including impaired or complete loss of concentration, lower reading comprehension, impaired speech perception, increased stress levels (for children and adults) and potentially resulting in lower test scores.
- Moreover, long-term health risks may include hearing damage, sleep disruption, cognitive development, and cardiac stress.
- We are also concerned about decreased air quality which exposes our school community to excess levels of dangerous dust, truck fuel fumes, and other potentially dangerous airborne particulates.
- I am also very concerned about the hazards caused by irresponsible/reckless driving on the part of the gravel trucks. I traverse Earhart every day to/from work. I have been cut off by several trucks pulling right out in front of me (turning south on Earhart from the pit) without checking for oncoming traffic. I am extremely cautious when approaching the pit entrance from either direction, as this has happened several times. I have also personally witnessed the truck drivers driving too fast along Earhart and failing to stop at the 4-way stop at the intersection of Warren & Earhart. I witnessed an incident when the FGR boys' cross-country team was running on Earhart and a double trailer truck raced up on them and swerved around them at considerable speed. With the hills on Earhart, this type of unsafe driving could prove fatal.
- It was my understanding that the trucks hauling gravel were only supposed to be traveling southbound on Earhart from the pit and not east/west on Joy Road. From my office at the studio I look out onto Joy

Road; I have seen trucks traveling eastbound (single and double loads) on Joy loaded with gravel. If there is a weight restriction for Joy Road precluding the gravel trucks from traversing that way, those trucks (I observe an average of 1 or 2 per day, and this is only when I'm looking out the window – this number could be significantly higher. I joke that I am “the granny on the hill-neighborhood watch” but I am not just sitting and watching out the window all day) are in violation of the weight limit.

- Our school community (comprising students, families, teachers) and educational studio staff (including our Sisters) deserves a settlement agreement with strong enforcement provisions to protect our children's learning environment.

Thank you for allowing me to voice my concerns.

Dear Board of Trustees of Ann Arbor Township,

Thank you for the opportunity to speak at the special meeting on October 1, 2025 and share input on issues related to the Mid-Michigan Materials Vella Pit, and for all the work you do to serve our Township. It has come to my attention that the session was not recorded until 2 hours into the meeting, and so I am sharing the written form of my statement so that it can become part of the public record.

God bless you!

- My name is Sr. Catherine Thomas, and I am a member of the Dominican Sisters of Mary, Mother of the Eucharist, located at 4597 Warren Road.
- I currently serve as the Prioress of our Motherhouse community. In this capacity, I am particularly responsible for the day-to-day health and safety of our Sisters.
- It is unjust that our Sisters cannot take walks, jog, and bike along the roads without encountering excess levels of dangerous dust and truck fuel fumes, enormous potholes, and trucks frequently driven well in excess of posted speed limits.
- Likewise, our school parents and their children, who use the same roads as MMM, are exposed to risk during their commutes, not to mention the excessive noise and dust that disrupt the children in the classroom and during playground hours.
- Truck traffic, which is constant, sometimes outside of permissible hours, disregarding posted stop signs, and along routes not approved for the weight of the carried load, endangers the Sisters, our schoolchildren, and their families, and other residents who use the roads.
- They must deal with damaged roads, large trucks full of heavy gravel, and queuing which sometimes turns Earhart Rd. into a dangerous 1-lane road.
- Our school families are especially exposed to such increased risk during drop-off, & pick-up at the beginning & end of the school day.
- In August a school family (on the way to school with 2 young children) was hit by a one-ton pickup truck hauling equipment attempting to enter the mine.

- What if that had been one of the many single or double-trailer trucks carrying a full load of gravel? Will you wait for a more serious tragedy to occur before taking action?
- We are concerned that road repairs on Nixon, Warren, and Earhart roads are already exacerbating this situation further.
- Moreover, as one of my fellow Sisters has already shared, such disruptions negatively impact the use of our trails through the Grandeur Oaks lots we own. Use of such trails (as well as a trail we added to serve our school) is part of our contemplative life and the physical regimen we provide our Sisters, students, and staff.
- Such disruptions also migrate from the mine's activities as a hazard to the outdoor physical exercise regimen of our Sisters at our Motherhouse athletic fields. Such regimens are essential to our Sisters staying active and healthy.
- Thus, we call on the township to pro-actively enforce noise, dust, and traffic ordinances, and to ensure compliance through the settlement agreement by using all available independent third-party monitoring services and technologies.

In Jesus and Mary,

Sr. Catherine Thomas, O.P.

Dominican Sisters of Mary,

Mother of the Eucharist

4597 Warren Rd.

Ann Arbor, MI 48105

Confidentiality Notice: This e-mail message, including any attachments, is for the sole use of the intended recipient(s) and may contain confidential information. Any unauthorized review, use, disclosure or distribution is prohibited. If you are not the intended recipient, please contact the sender by reply e-mail and destroy all copies of the original message.

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of Ann Arbor Charter Township. DO NOT click on links or open attachments unless you were expecting the email, recognize the sender, and know the content is safe.

**Statement for Public input session on issues related to the Mid-Michigan Materials  
Vella Pit**

**Board of Trustees Special Meeting, October 1<sup>st</sup>, 2025, 7:00pm**

**Submitted by Sr. Joseph Andrew Bogdanowicz, OP**

Dominican Sisters of Mary, Mother of the Eucharist

4597 Warren Road, Ann Arbor Township

- I'm Sr. Joseph Andrew Bogdanowicz, another of the four foundresses of the Dominican Sisters of Mary, Mother of the Eucharist, living at our Motherhouse at 4597 Warren Road.
- I also served as vocation director for 25 years, helping young women discern whether God is calling them to our religious community as teachers in a world so in need of hope.
- Our community has lived here for 26 years, building the kind of peaceful environment for spiritual formation and education that draws these young women to our community
- As Mother noted, we've invested heavily in our properties. Our efforts reflect our commitment to our students and their families, our neighbors, and Ann Arbor Township.
- We will be at our Motherhouse, and hopefully our schools, for many decades – maybe even centuries – to come. Others may come and go, but we are here to stay.
- Our properties are not simply financial investments we expect to monetize in the future. Everything we have exists to support our mission as preachers & teachers of the Gospel.
- This same mission has been carried out by members of the worldwide Dominican order for over 800 years.
- To fulfill this mission our life as religious women is rooted in silence and contemplation. Everything we proclaim and hand on to others, we first ponder in prayer.
- Our Motherhouse chapel is an oasis of peace, as evidenced by the number of visitors who join us for evening prayer on Sunday nights.

- Likewise, our purchase of three Grandeur Oaks vacant lots is purposeful: we utilize the trails we have created there to further support our formation as religious Sisters.
- However, while the issues of noise, dust, and truck traffic are significant, the safety of our water has the potential to be a long-term existential threat to our community.
- Thus, we simply must have assurances from the township that any damage to the aquifer will be fully evaluated and remediated within the context of any settlement agreement, and that our water will be protected for the many years after the mine has closed.

In Jesus, Mary, Joseph and all our saints!!

Sr. Joseph Andrew Bogdanowicz, OP

*Eucharistic & Marian Revival Speaker*

Dominican Sisters of Mary, Mother of the Eucharist

4597 Warren Rd., Ann Arbor, MI. 48105

## Special Township Meeting 10/1

Comments: Kay Yourist

4125 Earhart Road

The water issue is not simply one of have our wells recovered? It also is an issue of water quality. Numerous residents have documented serious water quality issues. Two that we are personally experiencing with our water: increased particles and foul odor. We need a clear and concise procedure for these water quality issues to be reported and mitigated by MMM; they replaced our well when it went dry but who do Susan and I go to now that we have foul smelling water with a high particle count that we cannot drink and only use when we must? How do we get reimbursement for the costly water filtration system we now need to install in our home? For the expensive maintenance this system will require indefinitely?

All aspects of the restoration of Massey Lake and the wetlands must be clearly defined. A reclamation plan MUST include citizen input and participation before settled on.

Settlement terms MUST include a reduction in the outrageous number of trucks their expired CUP allows. Truck counts need to be strengthened, not weakened - we need daily, weekly and monthly counts so the math is transparent. And settlement terms must include the stipulation that MMM cannot and will not request that neither Earhart Road, Warren Road and/or Joy Road be classified as a "haul route." We ALL must do absolutely everything we can to support the Ann Arbor Township master plan of protecting the rural nature and beauty of our area. This mining operation will be gone one day but we and generations to come will be left with the devastating changes they have caused.



On Wednesday, October 8, 2025 at 01:58:28 PM EDT, Chris Cruz  
<christopher.i.cruz@gmail.com> wrote:

To the Trustees of the Ann Arbor Township,

My name is Chris Cruz and I live in Ann Arbor township. I live 2 miles from MMM's Vella Pit and have lived here for six years.

I want to share how my well has been impacted, on why the proposed settlement terms do not protect our residents, and my thoughts regarding MMM's practices

Our well was installed on 6/27/19 and is 101 feet deep. The static water level on 6/27/19 was 30 feet. We tested our well depth on 8/9/23 and the static water level was now 39.5 feet. In four years, we lost about 10 feet of water for the pump to access. Our EGLE-approved well representative said it's "normal" for wells to drop 1-2 feet a year and "alarming" to drop 6-7+ feet. We remain concerned b/c we are losing well depth at an above average pace.

Now, we have the power and opportunity to settle the lawsuit on our terms in a way that benefits the Township and its residents. It seems like we are settling to MMM, and not vice versa. Rather, we should consider this settlement an invitation to ask for what we want and build in contingencies for when, not if, MMM continues its pattern of doing whatever it wants in the next 6 years. And as an aside, their proposed 6-year window is likely related only to MMM's strategic plans to abandon mining here at that point anyway, so it is not really a concession of any sort. The township homeowners do not want to spend the next six years preoccupied with this. The settlement agreement must give more monetary coverage to homeowners. I respectfully request that you take this into consideration when negotiating with MMM.

Furthermore, if township residents have to dig deeper wells, the deeper aquifer may contain arsenic and other toxins, compromising the reliability and safety of the water supply.

MMM should immediately cease dewatering. Water levels need to recover to pre-MMM levels.

I was unable to attend last week's township meeting about this, but I heard that the comments were not recorded, which is disappointing as the township people's comments were likely not entirely included into the public record.

Do you live in the township? Are you not concerned about your water well?

Please listen to your residents and change course in your desire to reach a settlement with the current terms from MMM, which right now seems insufficient and does not really advocate for the citizens of the township and your constituents.

Thank you,

-Christopher Cruz

---

## Public Comment for October 1 2025 meeting

---

From Hollis Dayton <holarbor@sbcglobal.net>

Date Wed 10/1/2025 10:59 AM

To Trustees <trustees@aatwp.org>; Diane O'Connell <supervisor@aatwp.org>; Clerk <clerk@aatwp.org>

I ask that these comments be summarized and presented at the October 1, 2025 public input session and incorporated into the minutes.

Hollis Dayton  
3909 Earhart Rd.

It's been 5 years since this commercial scale mine, MMM, has taken over what was once a small family operation. Simply; it does not fit this community.

The first C.U.P. underestimated this companies actions, growth and disregard for regulation. MMM has repeatedly shown that they will do as they wish for their monetary gain. There's been repeated ~environmental disregard - polluting wetlands, Massey Lake, streams and dewatering/contaminating our aquifer.

roads and community activity  
standards

~disregard for safety - inappropriate truck size and numbers for our

~nuisance to our day to day lives - noise and dust beyond reasonable

~constant violations of state and township regulation

My concern and request is to build on the first township settlement with succinct language, monitoring and enforcement. My community colleagues have pinpointed exact citings that need to be addressed. I wish to support their comments/claims. Without strict monitoring and some significant penalties for violations this mining company will continue to take as they wish, destroy as they need, and leave us in the wreckage in a matter of a few years.

Respectfully,  
Hollis

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of Ann Arbor Charter Township. DO NOT click on links or open attachments unless you were expecting the email, recognize the sender, and know the content is safe.

My understanding is that with enough money, corporations can thumb their noses at clean water and land, pay off who they must, and continue to defecate wherever it's convenient for them. This isn't seen as a problem, because the perception is that there's always enough water, land, air and sequestered park land beauty to go around. Money seems immediately far more necessary, the more the better. Am I about on target here? History would seem to say, "Why yes! You are!" Surprise me.

Thank you for your kind attention,

John Kelly, MD, MPH

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of Ann Arbor Charter Township. DO NOT click on links or open attachments unless you were expecting the email, recognize the sender, and know the content is safe.

## Vella Pit Concerns

As a citizen of Ann Arbor Township, I wonder how this problem started. And now I wonder how it persists.

I thought all was was solved at the big meeting a year and a half ago at washtenaw community college. Clearly no resident thought it was a good idea.

To begin, is the problem well understood?

How much water is used?

'3.1 GPD' according to the email

3,100,000 Gallons Per Day

Is this a lot of water?

Can this be put into context?

How much water do Ann Arbor Twp residents use?

Google says (for all below)

Census 2020

4747 residents

1958 households

300 gallons/day per household

seems pretty high but ok

$1958 * 300 = 587,400$  gallons/day

By all households

Quarry uses 3,100,000 gallons/day

So  $3100000 / 587400 = 5.277$

---

Quarry uses 5 times more than all the residents in the township every day

YES that is a LOT of water

---

What does 'uses' mean?

It is not consumed it is moved

Quarry pumps it from the underground pool (which is shared with the residents of Ann Arbor Twp) and exhausts it 'somewhere'

So the quarry is moving a tremendous amount of water from the shared aquifer. Since this is so much water, where it is directed is quite important. As is the long term impact of this activity

The questions that come to mind -

What are the possible outcomes?

In a month, in a year, in 10 years to the environment, residents wells, the quarry site?

When will this activity stop?

Why will it stop?

What happens when the activity stops?

Is some big remediation program going to be necessary? Like Gelman in neighboring Scio Twp for example

Worst outcome - all wells fail

Is there a plan to install piping and 'city water'?

John Koenig

30sept25

3570 E Joy Rd

810-599-7671

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of Ann Arbor Charter Township. DO NOT click on links or open attachments unless you were expecting the email, recognize the sender, and know the content is safe.

On Wednesday, October 1, 2025 at 12:35:31 PM EDT, Linda Stegmeyer  
<[stegmeyerlindal@gmail.com](mailto:stegmeyerlindal@gmail.com)> wrote:

Dear Ann Arbor Township Trustees:

I am writing to address the ongoing, unrelenting issues with the operators of the MMM Vella Pit. My husband and I live on Joy Rd., approximately one mile from this business. Although our house is in Northfield Township, we are just as impacted by its operations as our neighbors on the south side of the road. Ever since MMM took over from the previous owner, the quality of life in our neighborhood has diminished. These are our most important concerns:

1. The loss of water from personal wells in this area and the fear that our well could be next.
2. The quality of water coming from our well: on many days, we get a very unpleasant sulphur odor. Our next-door neighbor's water smells so much of sulphur that it hits you when you walk in the door.
3. With all the yard signs and obvious problems with the water here, we are concerned about the loss of property value.
4. The shameless and wanton degradation of the local environment that neither MMM nor the Ann Arbor Township Trustees seems to care about.
5. The numerous violations that the mine operators continue to incur, and the Township continues to forgive. Why are they allowed to operate business as usual, when they so brazenly break the law?
6. The endless number of heavy double-trailers that fly down Joy Rd. at 40+ mph, and are a hazard to walkers on Joy or Earhart. We no longer walk our dog in our own neighborhood because it feels too dangerous.
6. The utter disregard for the well-documented concerns of the residents. Although not everyone has been able to attend Township meetings, this neighborhood stands

shoulder to shoulder in solidarity: we want the operations at MMM to cease.

MMM is NOT a good neighbor, has proven that it has no intention of becoming one, and has come to depend on the Trustees to do little or nothing to force a change in that status. For those of us who live here, your failure to us is beyond discouraging. It's not too late to do the right thing for your constituents and their close neighbors. I sincerely hope that you find the courage to do so.

Respectfully,

Linda L. Stegmeyer

I am Louisa Self at 2443 Westbrooke Cir N, Ann Arbor, Northbrooke South Subdivision. We are located less than 1 ½ miles from MMM, as the crow flies. I am President of the HOA and speaking on behalf of myself and many neighbors.

Many of us have had our well water levels measured and have seen a drop in the water level although we are not close to the mine. Our home alone was tested in 2023 and had lost 2 feet in just a couple of years. Homes very close by have lost their wells. The township should be concerned about taking care of the resident taxpayers in the community and protecting them from businesses who operate in ways that negatively impact the community. Digging new, deeper wells is not the solution due to increased toxins at deeper levels and the water is still being replenished too rapidly for long term viability.

Homeowners have suffered from wells losing water and going dry, possible toxins in the water, and the impact of MMM being allowed to run a business without following rules. EGLE has confirmed that the operator has been providing information based upon an inaccurate model. The mine has expanded, at times unpermitted, and continued to adversely affect the water supply. Residents have been impacted by falling property values projected to be in the 5-30% range.

The 2020 CUP application stated inaccurate information: “The proposed use is consistent with the current use and past use for several decades,” and **“being consistent with decades of use, the proposed use will preserve and not negatively impact property values.”**

The settlement should not allow MMM to continue to operate for 6-8 more years without major modifications to how they operate and treat their neighbors. The monetary settlement should pay property owners for depreciation, well disruptions, extremes in water levels, and toxins, etc. The township should demand a substantial escrow amount for reclamation. MMM operations should be stopped until a plan can be developed to operate in a way to coexist peacefully in the community.

Township trustees, please listen to your residents.

## Lake Expansion at MMM Pit

---

**From** Marc Murawskii <marcmurawski@aol.com>

**Date** Wed 9/24/2025 3:43 PM

**To** Trustees <trustees@aatwp.org>; Diane O'Connell <supervisor@aatwp.org>

The attached email to EGLE shows that thousands of yards of material were moved and the south lake appears to be getting merged to middle lake . It is my understanding that expansion of lake not allowed. Attached photos comparing a year ago to this week illustrate changes in lake shore due to excavation.

Is this allowed ?

If it is unclear by provided photos that lakeshore expanded I can provide many more.

Thanks ,

Marc Murawski

1720 Warren Road Sent from my iPhone

Begin forwarded message:

**From:** Marc Murawskii <marcmurawski@aol.com>

**Date:** September 24, 2025 at 2:11:54 PM EDT

**To:** Jeff Pierce <piercej2@michigan.gov>, Mike Wilcynski <pangea52@yahoo.com>

**Subject:** Lake Expansion at MMM Pit

Jeff ,

Attached is photo from one year ago on September 11 , 2024 ( Figure 1and photo from Sunday Sept 21 , 2025.

It is very clear from this photo that thousands of yards of material have been removed and lake size increased . The main road thru the operation went east to west from wash plant area to Earhardt road . It is very clear in the photo taken on Sept 21 , 2025 that the area under the road and berms to water are no longer present and where the road was and is now lake . See Figure 3 below .

Please let me know if you agree with my observation. If you need more images for clarity I can provide .

Do you agree they have enlarged the lake and is that allowed ?

If it is not allowed what will the fines and corrective action be.

Thanks

Marc Murawski

Figure 1

image1.png

Sept 21 , 2025

Figure 2

image2.png

Red lines were road a year ago .

What is going on?

Figure 3

image2.jpeg

Sent from my iPhone

image1.png image2.jpeg image2.png

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of Ann Arbor Charter Township. DO NOT click on links or open attachments unless you were expecting the email, recognize the sender, and know the content is safe.

I am speaking today to my experience with years of living under a Communist government, and my disappointment when I saw the incompetence, hypocrisy, and lack of transparency at any level of national and local governance. It is a shock to see it again in my new country, in our own backyard.

Growing up in Poland before 1989 you could not trust what the government told you. Misinformation and lies and half-truths were normal.

When I became a US citizen, I was glad I could depend on the government to do what was the will of the people and not their own self-interest.

But what we have experienced in this township for the last four years is not new to me?

- a lack of respect for citizen input
- Released Documents that knowingly contain false information, such as the settlement hydrogeologic report, the truck traffic spreadsheets with conflicting data, and the incomplete settlement terms
- Dismissal and downplaying of citizen testimony, even when it is supported by state agency experts
- Overt bullying by a corporation of an entire community, which To This Day has not been stopped by my government, to whom we pay our taxes
- A severe degradation of our quality of life on my property, including water quality worse than two years ago

Will you fight for me and these people in this room?

You should not be afraid. We have truth on our side.

Stop supporting the lies and half-truths of this corporate monster.

Support the people you serve.

**If you believe this exceeds your competencies**, please **step down** and let the competent people to take care of our township living conditions, including the environmental safety of our water and air, health and beauty of our environment, value of our properties, and putting a STOP to the everyday nuisance of a company operating in our backyards.

Regarding the settlement, my wife, Amy, holding an MS in Public Administration and Finance, submitted our complete analysis of the terms as presented and compared them with the original lawsuit. There are great omissions, monetary damages unaddressed and no concrete enforcement and subsequent consequences for lack of compliance. A lot of work still needs to be done. I hope negotiations are strengthened by all the comments today.

The Board should rely on her professional analysis and the resultant demands and feel very supported to be tougher in negotiations and if necessary, appoint more competent lawyers.

## Special Township Meeting 10/1

Comments: Susan Minard

4125 Earhart Road

Trustees, I ask you to please help us understand why the township continues to bend over backwards to accommodate this mining conglomerate that has numerous times broken the terms set forth in their conditional use permit which has resulted in very serious consequences for our community? Why do this for a company that has devastated our natural resources, drastically reduced the safety and quality of life for residents and put the learning of school age children at risk? Why do this when your residents have made it very clear that we have suffered very serious consequences as a result of this mining operation? It makes absolutely no ethical sense. I am not alone when I say that I am absolutely bewildered by this pattern and I am weary.

First and foremost, we need the Board of Trustees to NOT propose settlement items that are based on a hydrological report commissioned by MMM that has been rejected by EGLE. PAUSE any talk of settlement and commission an independent valid hydrological report BEFORE putting forth settlement terms.

The era of vague reassurances to residents from the township and trusting MMM to follow the rules needs to end NOW. Any and all settlement terms MUST include clear and objective rules and consequences for violations. All settlement items MUST be monitored and enforced by the township. If the township does not have the appropriate and qualified staffing to do so but is going to allow MMM to operate in Ann Arbor Township, you MUST hire people who can. It is not the responsibility of tax paying citizens to do the work the township cannot or will not do. Yet that is exactly what we have had to do. It was Hollis Dayton and Tanya Whalen who first recognized the need to better understand how many wells were being impacted and we initiated a plan to reach out and connect neighbors. From that first initiative, the scope of the issue was discovered and

numerous neighbors since have come together to support and advocate for this community. Michael Watts and Amy O. have dedicated innumerable hours and resources to protecting this community. Kay and I are grateful for them and for all of our neighbors. This community of good people have done this work - your work - because it has needed to be done. We love our homes and we work hard to be good stewards of our land. We care for our neighbors, our natural resources, our way of life. But here is the thing: we all have lives to tend to beyond monitoring this mining operation and advocating for justice. The compliance of this mining operation is YOUR responsibility to manage, not ours.

I am a social worker at one of the largest middle schools in Michigan. We work hard at my school to teach our children how to be an upstander. If you are not familiar with the term, an upstander is a person who comes to the aid of another when they are being harmed by someone. Board of Trustees, we need you to be our upstander. This community has cooperated, pleaded and reasoned with you. This is your moment to right the wrongs that have been done to this community, to our natural resources and to the future residents of Ann Arbor Township.

I close with a quote from Nelson Mandela:

“It always seems impossible until it’s done.”



To Whom It May Concern:

Since the Vella Pit began operations on Earhart Road, our neighborhood has suffered under increasing strain and disruption. Unfortunately, the company has proven itself to be anything but a good neighbor. The consequences of its operations — from excessive truck traffic to damage to local wells and the environment — are real, dangerous, and growing.

### **Safety, Road Damage, and Reckless Driving**

My foremost concern is with the condition of our roads and the behavior of the pit's trucks. Earhart Road is in a state of disrepair — full of deep potholes and cracked surfaces — forcing drivers to swerve unexpectedly into oncoming traffic. This is nothing short of a public safety crisis.

Even more alarming are the dangerous actions of oversized trucks while navigating local streets:

- On August 6 at 11:33 a.m., my husband was driving south on Earhart near the intersection of Ave Maria when a Vella Pit truck (license E333009) began honking aggressively, urging him through a red light. He was forced to inch toward oncoming traffic to avoid collision, only for the truck to speed past and flash the middle finger.
- On September 25, despite marked “Local Traffic Only” closures on Warren Rd, Vella Pit trucks repeatedly ignored the barriers, racing westbound at breakneck speeds. One nearly struck me while I was fetching my mail. The truck driver did not slow down.

Every day as I drive southbound on Earhart to pick up my child at SSA, I find myself and other parents pushed toward the edge of the road by oversized, passing trucks. This is not safe, and it is untenable.

### **Threat to Water, Wells & the Ecosystem**

The negative impact of the Vella Pit reaches far beyond road damage. We now face serious threats to our water supply and local ecology:

- According to Ann Arbor Township's legal complaint, the pit's operations have allegedly **dried up multiple residential wells, violated township ordinances, and degraded surrounding properties.**
- State investigators from Michigan's Department of Environment, Great Lakes, and Energy (EGLE) determined that sediment from the site has been discharged into nearby wetlands, lakes, and waterways — a violation of protections for inland streams, wetlands, and water resource laws.

- Local grassroots efforts report that over 28 wells in the vicinity have been damaged — either going dry or suffering severe pressure decline.
- The distress to Fleming Creek, the surrounding wetlands, and surface ponds is already noticeable. Sediment buildup, altered flow, and drying of ponds are among the documented consequences.

This is more than just inconvenience. These are violations of environmental law and violations of the trust the community placed in conditional permits.

### **Our Rights, Our Safety, and Our Future**

We residents deserve more than platitudes. We need accountability and transparent systems for lodging complaints — and we need those complaints addressed with urgency and integrity. The township must prioritize protecting its citizens and natural resources over unchecked industrial activity.

I propose the following:

1. Establish a **dedicated website or portal** for residents to submit truck-, road-, and environmental-impact complaints (with tracking, status, and resolution).
2. Mandate that **every submitted complaint** be formally acknowledged, investigated, and responded to (with written records).
3. Implement **routine inspections and enforcement** of road standards, truck behavior, and environmental compliance.
4. Commission an **independent hydrological and environmental audit** of Vella Pit's operations, to assess damage, recommend remediation, and hold operators accountable.
5. Temporarily suspend new or expanded operations until all violations and resident concerns are fully addressed.

Our neighborhood is being compromised slowly, day by day. We ask that the voices and safety of those who live here not be ignored, diminished, or de-prioritized. We deserve — and demand — dignified treatment, clear accountability, and true protection of our homes, wells, and environment.

Sincerely,  
Monika Leja  
3975 Warren Rd  
Ann Arbor, MI

---

## Comments regarding Settlement

---

From Mother Amata Veritas <motheramataveritas@sistersofmary.org>

Date Wed 10/1/2025 10:08 AM

To Trustees <trustees@aatwp.org>

Dear Ann Arbor Township Trustees:

My name is Mother Amata Veritas, and I am the current Prioress General of the Dominican Sisters of Mary, Mother of the Eucharist.

Because I am unable to attend the special meeting on issues related to the Mid-Michigan Materials Vella Pit on October 1, 2025, I ask that these comments be publicly summarized at the input session, then incorporated into the minutes and transcripts for the public session. Today, I am responsible for the well-being of our many Sisters—most of whom live at our Motherhouse located at 4597 Warren Road —and nearly 200 students and staff at our Spiritus Sanctus Academy located on Joy Road. For 26 years, we have worked to build a peaceful, stable environment for spiritual formation and education. Our investments in the Motherhouse and Spiritus Sanctus Academy—including property expansion and facility upgrades—reflect our long-term commitment to this place, our neighbors, and Ann Arbor Township.

As Sr. Joseph Andrew will explain in her statements tonight, unlike other property owners, we are not temporary residents. We are here to stay. Our properties are not financial assets to be sold or developed—they exist solely to support our mission as Dominican Sisters, a mission rooted in prayer, study, and service for over 800 years.

While the noise, dust, and truck traffic from the Vella Pit are serious concerns, the potential threat to our water supply is even more alarming. We urge the Township to ensure that any damage to the aquifer is fully remediated at the mine's expense and that our water source is protected for the decades we plan to remain here after the mine has closed.

Our life as religious women is grounded in silence and contemplation. Everything we teach and preach flows from prayer. Our chapel is a place of peace for our community and neighbors, as seen by the many who join us for Sunday Evening Prayer. Our recent purchase of three Grandeur Oaks lots has allowed us to create walking trails that further support our formation and way of life.

Our stake in this issue is significant—likely greater than any other nearby property owner. We have been respectful neighbors and visible members of this community. That is why we are increasingly concerned about the mine's impact. Everything we have built and stand for is at risk due to the serious health, safety, and environmental issues posed by the Vella Pit.

We respectfully ask the Township to act decisively to protect the long-term well-being of our community and all who call this area home. Faithfully in Christ,

Mother Amata Veritas OP  
Prioress General

Dominican Sisters of Mary, Mother of the Eucharist  
4597 Warren Rd  
Ann Arbor MI 48105

Confidentiality Notice: This e-mail message, including any attachments, is for the sole use of the intended recipient(s) and may contain confidential information. Any unauthorized review, use, disclosure or distribution is prohibited. If you are not the intended recipient, please contact the sender by reply e-mail and destroy all copies of the original message.

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of Ann Arbor Charter Township. DO NOT click on links or open attachments unless you were expecting the email, recognize the sender, and know the content is safe.

**Ann Arbor Township  
MMM Public Input Session  
October 1, 2025**

It is a little frustrating that the community is being asked to provide comment on proposed settlement terms and there are apparently more terms and conditions which may directly influence the nature of our comments.

This Township has consistently held that applicants must have all outside agency reviews and approvals before they will even be placed on the agenda. MMM does not have the required EGLE permits to operate. Any settlement should not occur until all outstanding violations with EGLE are resolved and cured and all permits have been properly approved.

They submitted a hydrogeological study that was deemed inaccurate and lacking, so any settlement at this time puts the aquifer at an unacceptable risk.

This agreement allows them to operate until the end of 2031 – 6 ½ years past when their initial permit expired. Any settlement should be consistent with the mining ordinance’s 5-year renewal, which should require termination of operations in the summer of 2030, at latest.

This Settlement does not address any penalties (financial or otherwise) for past violations and what the penalties will be for future violations.

All reclamation funds should be secured with a performance guarantee for the full cost of restoring the land and the Township’s typical 3-year monitoring. This is likely tens of thousands per acre. An independent, third party should review the costs to restore, revegetate and reforest the property. The reclamation plan needs to be approved and the cost determined before a settlement, not “...on a future date yet to be negotiated...”

Any settlement should include a required monthly road maintenance escrow for the duration of MMM's operations, not just gravel and limestone "at least every two years".

All monitoring for noise needs to be independently conducted with information shared directly with residents via live reporting on the Township website. Violations need to be immediately addressed with up to and including suspension of operations.

In sense from our neighbors, no one is interested in MMM having the right to take "reasonable efforts," their blatant disregard for the health, safety and welfare of this community requires clearly articulated enforcement requirements in any settlement.

The devastation to our community that the industrial scale mining of MMM has caused since their arrival (adversely impacting the aquifer with the resulting damage to wells, illegal discharges to protected wetlands and the downstream impact of the contamination of Massey Lake to the point it can barely sustain aquatic life, degradation of roads, decline in the quality life of neighbors from noise, dust and other nuisances) demands settlement terms that are fully in the interests of the residents and tax paying property owners of this community – not the entity causing these problems.

John J. Petz  
Director of Real Estate & Public Affairs  
Domino's Farms Corporation  
24 Frank Lloyd Wright Drive  
Ann Arbor, MI 48106

## TOWNSHIP COMMENTS 9-30-25

R. Kunkel

Tonight I have several questions, that I hope you will answer. First I want you to know that last month we have had to replace three faucets in our house as they were almost clogged shut and the water flow was at a trickle. This was not a planned remodel. We also had to replace the water pressure tank bladder in hopes that it would help with increasing our water pressure. So our household has on going water quality issues.

Now my questions regarding the “settlement”.

1. What does “enforceable consent judgement” mean? Are there fines, penalties, mine closures, if agreement conditions are not met? These MUST be clearly stated. Saying that the township “could take enforcement action” does not engender confidence. The mine has deep pockets, small fines are meaningless. How will the mining operations be monitored? This is critical. How will infraction reporting be handled? In the past it has basically fallen on the community to be the reporters of problems.
2. WHY give them 6 years of further mining without another CUP? Is it in our best interests, or the mines? Is it because according to the Michigan Compiled Laws the statute of limitations is 6 years to recover natural resources damages? They can get off scott free from damages they have inflicted now. This is unacceptable.
3. Who approves the final plans and the final work done to reclaim the mine site at the end of 6 years? If approved by EGLE, is the 60 acre lake a done deal for the final reclamation plan? I for one do not support it,
4. Doesn't WSG Properties (which is Dan's and Ajax) own the land the mine is on, and they just lease it to MMM? At the end of 6 years what is to stop WSG from leasing the mining rights to another shell company and continue industrial level mining. THIS IS A HUGE RED FLAG FOR ME. Is it basically WSG's call on how the property will be used at the end of 6 years? Are there ANY limitations on its future usage? Could the township recover the property as part of the conditions for a settlement and build something for the good of the entire township- hiking trails, picnic area, or a park. After 6 years would a new mine be able to dewater? Would we be back at square one after 6 years?
5. What will be done to rehab the wetlands and Massey Lake from the damage that MMM has done already? The township's ordinances say that wetlands must be restored or if not possible new wetlands must be installed at 1.5X the original size. This should be included in the settlement. Residents are held to this standard, the mine should be also.
6. Since MMM's hydrogeological comprehensive plan was found by EGLE to contain errors and using a flawed model, will the township require them to submit a new hydrogeology report, and have it evaluated by an expert?

In closing I would just say, that speaking for my family, as you go forward negotiating the settlement, we do NOT want things that stress the aquifer, the environment and the residents in this community.

**Statement for Public input session on issues related to the Mid-Michigan Materials Vella Pit Board of Trustees Special Meeting, October 1<sup>st</sup>, 2025, 7:00pm**

**Submitted by Sr. Elizabeth Ann O'Reilly, OP**

Dominican Sisters of Mary, Mother of the Eucharist  
4597 Warren Road, Ann Arbor Township

- My name is Sr. Elizabeth Ann O'Reilly, and I also serve on the General Council of the Dominican Sisters of Mary, Mother of the Eucharist, located at 4597 Warren Road, as well the board of Spiritus Sanctus Academy.
- As a Dominican Sister, I am an educator. For the past nine years, I taught students at Father Gabriel Richard high school. In doing so, I stressed to them the importance of participating in public life.
- While they should contribute to the common good primarily by fulfilling their personal responsibilities, they also must build up the common good through activities such as voting, paying taxes and respecting those in authority.
- I also taught them about the responsibilities of those in public office. Those in authority serve the common good by promoting respect for the dignity of the human person and ensuring justice and stability by protecting the rights of all.
- Social justice is achieved when citizens and those in authority work together to ensure what is needed is provided so that all can reach their fulfilment as a group or individually.
- Thus, it saddens me to find an example of injustice in our own community due to the actions of a mine that cannot be trusted and shows little regard for other property owners.
- Accordingly, we have placed our trust in Ann Arbor township, and you board members, to do the right thing: specifically, to bring the mine into full compliance with its legal and monetary obligations.
- We know you agree with this objective. Otherwise, the township would not have filed the lawsuit against the mine in the first place.
- Therefore, you must ensure that the settlement agreement holds the mine accountable for the environment, requires firm adherence to any enforceable consent judgment, and provides monetary compensation to any harmed property owners.
- The township has had two years to uphold the trust we have placed in you. The time to act more forcefully in defense of property owners is now through an iron-clad settlement agreement which holds the mine accountable now and for years to come.

**Statement for Public input session on issues related to the Mid-Michigan Materials Vella Pit  
Board of Trustees Special Meeting, October 1<sup>st</sup>, 2025, 7:00pm  
Submitted by Sr. Louis Marie Zogg, OP**

Dominican Sisters of Mary, Mother of the Eucharist  
4597 Warren Road, Ann Arbor Township

- My name is Sr. Louis Marie Zogg, and I serve on the General Council of the Dominican Sisters of Mary, Mother of the Eucharist located at 4597 Warren Road.
- In addition to my role in helping to govern our community, I serve on the board of Spiritus Sanctus Academy (SSA), situated across from the Vella Pit at 4101 E. Joy Road. I also hold the position of Novice Mistress, overseeing the formation of our newest Sisters.
- These responsibilities connect me deeply to the lives of our Sisters, as well as the students and staff at our schools and other entities.
- Our presence here matters. We've been good neighbors, visible and respectful. And now, with growing concerns about the mine, we feel a responsibility to speak up yet again!
- Specifically, we remain concerned that rising water levels in some wells (including ours), the lack of recovery in others, and recently documented water quality issues at many properties are just a different and continuing manifestation of a damaged aquifer.
- We have noticed changes in smell and taste to our water. This raises real questions in our minds about its safety. To what can you attribute these changes? How do we know the water is safe?
- It further raises questions as to whether all steps have been taken to investigate water safety? Have you communicated regularly with EGLE? How do your and their areas of responsibility intersect to protect property owners' interests?
- We're not only concerned about its safety today but also in the future. Has the aquifer been damaged irreparably? Can we be assured that it is in acceptable condition not only now, but for years to come?
- I ask these questions because as Sr. Joseph Andrew noted our community is not leaving. We are responsible for both current and future Sisters, students, and their families.
- The solution is actually quite simple: only competent third-party hydrogeological professionals with no attachment to the mine can answer these questions and provide us with the certainty that is our right and your responsibility.

**Statement for Public input session on issues related to the Mid-Michigan Materials/Vella Pit Board of Trustees Special Meeting, October 1, 2025, 7:00pm**

**Submitted by Sr. Maria Gemma Martek, OP**

Dominican Sisters of Mary, Mother of the Eucharist  
4597 Warren Road, Ann Arbor Township

- My name is Sister Maria Gemma Martek; I am a member of the Dominican Sisters of Mary, Mother of the Eucharist located at 4597 Warren Rd. I am also the former principal of Spiritus Sanctus Academy (4101 E. Joy Rd.). I currently work at our audio/visual educational studio adjacent to the school at 4225 E. Joy Rd., directly opposite the MMM Vella Gravel Pit on the north side of Joy Road.
- I am appearing today to emphasize that Mid Michigan Material's operations have created a serious, ongoing, and public health concern affecting our students, teachers and staff.
- Our school and educational studio are in closer proximity to the mine than any other single property.
- The noise emanating from mine and truck traffic activities has disrupted our ability to provide our students with a quality and peaceful learning environment, potentially increasing the risk of immediate and long-term learning and developmental issues.
- The children entrusted to us and their teachers face noise disruption continuously throughout the school day, from the time they arrive until the time they depart.
- Research demonstrates that noise levels above 60-65 dB can significantly impair learning, yet the noise level range of the mine's activities can reach, and has reached, as high as 70-80 dB.
- As educators, we know that noise may have any of the following significant impacts on a child's learning, attention and focus, including impaired or complete loss of concentration, lower reading comprehension, impaired speech perception, increased stress levels (for children and adults) and potentially resulting in lower test scores.
- Moreover, long-term health risks may include hearing damage, sleep disruption, cognitive development, and cardiac stress.
- We are also concerned about decreased air quality which exposes our school community to excess levels of dangerous dust, truck fuel fumes, and other potentially dangerous airborne particulates.
- I am also very concerned about the hazards caused by irresponsible/reckless driving on the part of the gravel trucks. I traverse Earhart every day to/from work. I have been cut off by several trucks pulling right out in front of me (turning south on Earhart from the pit) without checking for oncoming traffic. I am extremely cautious when approaching the pit entrance from either direction, as this has happened several times. I have also personally witnessed the truck drivers driving too fast along Earhart and failing to stop at the 4-way stop at the intersection of Warren & Earhart. I witnessed an incident when the FGR boys' cross-country team was running on Earhart and a double trailer truck raced up on them and swerved around them at considerable speed. With the hills on Earhart, this type of unsafe driving could prove fatal.
- It was my understanding that the trucks hauling gravel were only supposed to be traveling southbound on Earhart from the pit and not east/west on Joy Road. From my office at the studio I look out onto Joy

Road; I have seen trucks traveling eastbound (single and double loads) on Joy loaded with gravel. If there is a weight restriction for Joy Road precluding the gravel trucks from traversing that way, those trucks (I observe an average of 1 or 2 per day, and this is only when I'm looking out the window – this number could be significantly higher. I joke that I am “the granny on the hill-neighborhood watch” but I am not just sitting and watching out the window all day) are in violation of the weight limit.

- Our school community (comprising students, families, teachers) and educational studio staff (including our Sisters) deserves a settlement agreement with strong enforcement provisions to protect our children's learning environment.

Thank you for allowing me to voice my concerns.

Dear Board of Trustees of Ann Arbor Township,

Thank you for the opportunity to speak at the special meeting on October 1, 2025 and share input on issues related to the Mid-Michigan Materials Vella Pit, and for all the work you do to serve our Township. It has come to my attention that the session was not recorded until 2 hours into the meeting, and so I am sharing the written form of my statement so that it can become part of the public record.

God bless you!

- My name is Sr. Catherine Thomas, and I am a member of the Dominican Sisters of Mary, Mother of the Eucharist, located at 4597 Warren Road.
- I currently serve as the Prioress of our Motherhouse community. In this capacity, I am particularly responsible for the day-to-day health and safety of our Sisters.
- It is unjust that our Sisters cannot take walks, jog, and bike along the roads without encountering excess levels of dangerous dust and truck fuel fumes, enormous potholes, and trucks frequently driven well in excess of posted speed limits.
- Likewise, our school parents and their children, who use the same roads as MMM, are exposed to risk during their commutes, not to mention the excessive noise and dust that disrupt the children in the classroom and during playground hours.
- Truck traffic, which is constant, sometimes outside of permissible hours, disregarding posted stop signs, and along routes not approved for the weight of the carried load, endangers the Sisters, our schoolchildren, and their families, and other residents who use the roads.
- They must deal with damaged roads, large trucks full of heavy gravel, and queuing which sometimes turns Earhart Rd. into a dangerous 1-lane road.
- Our school families are especially exposed to such increased risk during drop-off, & pick-up at the beginning & end of the school day.
- In August a school family (on the way to school with 2 young children) was hit by a one-ton pickup truck hauling equipment attempting to enter the mine.

- What if that had been one of the many single or double-trailer trucks carrying a full load of gravel? Will you wait for a more serious tragedy to occur before taking action?
- We are concerned that road repairs on Nixon, Warren, and Earhart roads are already exacerbating this situation further.
- Moreover, as one of my fellow Sisters has already shared, such disruptions negatively impact the use of our trails through the Grandeur Oaks lots we own. Use of such trails (as well as a trail we added to serve our school) is part of our contemplative life and the physical regimen we provide our Sisters, students, and staff.
- Such disruptions also migrate from the mine's activities as a hazard to the outdoor physical exercise regimen of our Sisters at our Motherhouse athletic fields. Such regimens are essential to our Sisters staying active and healthy.
- Thus, we call on the township to pro-actively enforce noise, dust, and traffic ordinances, and to ensure compliance through the settlement agreement by using all available independent third-party monitoring services and technologies.

In Jesus and Mary,

Sr. Catherine Thomas, O.P.

Dominican Sisters of Mary,

Mother of the Eucharist

4597 Warren Rd.

Ann Arbor, MI 48105

Confidentiality Notice: This e-mail message, including any attachments, is for the sole use of the intended recipient(s) and may contain confidential information. Any unauthorized review, use, disclosure or distribution is prohibited. If you are not the intended recipient, please contact the sender by reply e-mail and destroy all copies of the original message.

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of Ann Arbor Charter Township. DO NOT click on links or open attachments unless you were expecting the email, recognize the sender, and know the content is safe.



Outlook

---

## Comments for the special meeting on issues related to the Mid-Michigan Materials Vella Pit

---

From Sr. Maria Faustina (SSA) <srmariafaustina@spiritussanctus.org>

Date Wed 10/1/2025 9:59 AM

To Trustees <trustees@aatwp.org>

Dear Ann Arbor Township Trustees:

My name is Sr. Maria Faustina, and I am a member of the Dominican Sisters of Mary, Mother of the Eucharist, and I am a resident of our convent at 4597 Warren Road. I currently serve as principal of our second Spiritus Sanctus Academy school, which is located in Plymouth, Michigan. Because I am unable to attend the special meeting on issues related to the Mid-Michigan Materials Vella Pit on October 1, 2025, I ask that these comments be publicly summarized at the input session, then incorporated into the minutes and transcripts for the public session.

I am submitting this testimony to express deep concern regarding the operations of the Michigan Materials Mine (MMM), which have resulted in a persistent and serious public health issue directly impacting our students, faculty, and staff. Even though my school is not directly impacted by the activities of the mine, our two academies are closely linked such that whatever affects one school community also has repercussions in our school community.

As Sr. Maria Gemma will point out in her comments tonight, our Ann Arbor Campus is geographically closer to the mine than any other single property in the area. The continuous noise generated by mining activities and truck traffic has significantly disrupted our ability to maintain a peaceful and effective learning environment. This disruption poses both immediate and long-term risks to the cognitive and emotional development of our students.

Beyond the educational impact, prolonged exposure to elevated noise levels can lead to serious health consequences, including hearing damage, sleep disturbances, cognitive delays, and increased cardiac stress.

Additionally, we are gravely concerned about deteriorating air quality in the vicinity of our school. The presence of airborne particulates—including dust, truck exhaust fumes, and other hazardous materials—poses further risks to the health and well-being of our students and staff.

Considering these ongoing issues, we respectfully urge the adoption of a settlement agreement that includes robust enforcement provisions. Such measures are essential to safeguard the learning environment and ensure the health and safety of our students, their families, our faculty, and the Sisters who serve at Spiritus Sanctus Academy.

Thank you for your attention to this urgent matter.

Respectfully,

**Sr. Maria Faustina, OP**  
Principal  
Spiritus Sanctus Academy Plymouth  
10450 Rd. Plymouth, MI 48170  
(734) 414-8430



Confidentiality Notice: This e-mail message, including any attachments, is for the sole use of the intended recipient(s) and may contain confidential information. Any unauthorized review, use, disclosure or distribution is prohibited. If you are not the intended recipient, please contact the sender by reply e-mail and destroy all copies of the original message.

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of Ann Arbor Charter Township. DO NOT click on links or open attachments unless you were expecting the email, recognize the sender, and know the content is safe.

---

## Public input regarding MMM Vella Pit Mine

---

From Sr. Mary David <srmarydavid@sistersofmary.org>

Date Wed 10/1/2025 10:11 AM

To Trustees <trustees@aatwp.org>

Dear Ann Arbor Township Trustees:

My name is Sr. Mary David, and I am a member of the Dominican Sisters of Mary, Mother of the Eucharist as well as the current principal of Spiritus Sanctus Academy, located just across the road from Vella pit gravel mine.

Because I am unable to attend the special meeting on issues related to the Mid-Michigan Materials Vella Pit on October 1, 2025, I ask that these comments be publicly summarized at the input session, then incorporated into the minutes and transcripts for the public session.

While others have pointed out a number of issues, I would like to focus on a singular yet important and imminent issue. In mid-August 2025, just before the beginning of the new school year, we noticed that floor tiles in our school hallways were coming loose and the concrete underneath them was wet.

This leads us to a grave concern that water pumped from the mine into the aquifer, wetlands, and areas directly across Joy Rd. may be causing water levels on our property to rise.

The specific area of concern is the middle school part of the building constructed in 2002-2023 which is an area of approx. 5,800 square feet and includes our various classrooms: art/ music; 5<sup>th</sup> grade; 6<sup>th</sup> grade; 7<sup>th</sup> grade; 8<sup>th</sup> grade; middle school dean's office; and three adjoining prep rooms for the classrooms.

While further inquiry – which we have commenced at considerable expense and use of staff time – may prove otherwise, nevertheless, we need firm assurances from the township that these issues are not merely different manifestations of a damaged aquifer due to the mine's activity.

In this regard, we think it particularly notable that EGLE continues to require further information from the mine's expert, Haley and Aldrich, due to identified deficiencies in their hydrogeological model.

It is our understanding that because of this, Haley & Aldrich have requested an additional 90 days to respond (in addition to the 30 days they previously requested in mid-August).

Common sense leads one, at a minimum to ask two questions: is the mine's model deeply flawed AND is the mine attempting to manipulate the model to support a false conclusion as to the environmental impact of its operations?

With these concerns in mind, I am writing to respectfully ask that the Ann Arbor Township wait on a settlement until a complete hydrogeological study can be conducted by an independent third-party expert with no commercial relationship to the mine owners and operators.

Sincerely,  
Sr. Mary David Klocek, OP  
Principal

Confidentiality Notice: This e-mail message, including any attachments, is for the sole use of the intended recipient(s) and may contain confidential information. Any unauthorized review, use, disclosure or distribution is prohibited. If you are not the intended recipient, please contact the sender by reply e-mail and destroy all copies of the original message.

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of Ann Arbor Charter Township. DO NOT click on links or open attachments unless you were expecting the email, recognize the sender, and know the content is safe.

---

**Request**

---

**From** Sr. Mary Michael <srmarymichael@sistersofmary.org>

**Date** Wed 10/1/2025 1:50 PM

**To** Trustees <trustees@aatwp.org>

Dear Ann Arbor Township Trustees:

My name is Sr. Mary Michael Carlton, OP, and I am currently the Vicareess General and Director of Education for the Dominican Sisters of Mary, Mother of the Eucharist, located at 4597 Warren Road.

Because I am unable to attend the special meeting on issues related to the Mid-Michigan Materials Vella Pit on October 1, 2025, I ask that these comments be publicly summarized at the input session, then incorporated into the minutes and transcripts for the public session.

Since our community's arrival in Ann Arbor Township, we have worked to create a peaceful, contemplative environment that supports spiritual formation and academic excellence for young women and children from pre-K through 8th grade.

We have made significant, long-term investments in our property, including school expansion, new educational facilities, and land acquisition. These efforts, made possible by generous donors, reflect our deep commitment to this community and to Ann Arbor Township.

We have always been respectful neighbors and careful stewards of our land and the surrounding wetlands. Our Sisters are a daily presence along Warren, Earhart, and Joy Roads. However, the ongoing truck traffic, noise, dust, and water concerns—issues my fellow Sisters will address at tonight's public input session—remain unresolved and continue to impact our community.

I respectfully urge Township officials to take meaningful action to address these concerns. Please prioritize the health, safety, and quality of life of all residents—especially those who have dedicated their lives to prayer, education, and service in this community.

Respectfully,  
*Sr. Mary Michael, OP*

Vicareess General  
Dominican Sisters of Mary, Mother of the Eucharist

Confidentiality Notice: This e-mail message, including any attachments, is for the sole use of the intended recipient(s) and may contain confidential information. Any unauthorized review, use, disclosure or distribution is prohibited. If you are not the intended recipient, please contact the sender by reply e-mail and destroy all copies of the original message.

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of Ann Arbor Charter Township. DO NOT click on links or open attachments unless you were expecting the email, recognize the sender, and know the content is safe.

**Statement for Public input session on issues related to the Mid-Michigan Materials  
Vella Pit**

**Board of Trustees Special Meeting, October 1<sup>st</sup>, 2025, 7:00pm**

**Submitted by Sr. Joseph Andrew Bogdanowicz, OP**

Dominican Sisters of Mary, Mother of the Eucharist  
4597 Warren Road, Ann Arbor Township

- I'm Sr. Joseph Andrew Bogdanowicz, another of the four foundresses of the Dominican Sisters of Mary, Mother of the Eucharist, living at our Motherhouse at 4597 Warren Road.
- I also served as vocation director for 25 years, helping young women discern whether God is calling them to our religious community as teachers in a world so in need of hope.
- Our community has lived here for 26 years, building the kind of peaceful environment for spiritual formation and education that draws these young women to our community
- As Mother noted, we've invested heavily in our properties. Our efforts reflect our commitment to our students and their families, our neighbors, and Ann Arbor Township.
- We will be at our Motherhouse, and hopefully our schools, for many decades – maybe even centuries – to come. Others may come and go, but we are here to stay.
- Our properties are not simply financial investments we expect to monetize in the future. Everything we have exists to support our mission as preachers & teachers of the Gospel.
- This same mission has been carried out by members of the worldwide Dominican order for over 800 years.
- To fulfill this mission our life as religious women is rooted in silence and contemplation. Everything we proclaim and hand on to others, we first ponder in prayer.
- Our Motherhouse chapel is an oasis of peace, as evidenced by the number of visitors who join us for evening prayer on Sunday nights.

- Likewise, our purchase of three Grandeur Oaks vacant lots is purposeful: we utilize the trails we have created there to further support our formation as religious Sisters.
- However, while the issues of noise, dust, and truck traffic are significant, the safety of our water has the potential to be a long-term existential threat to our community.
- Thus, we simply must have assurances from the township that any damage to the aquifer will be fully evaluated and remediated within the context of any settlement agreement, and that our water will be protected for the many years after the mine has closed.

In Jesus, Mary, Joseph and all our saints!!

Sr. Joseph Andrew Bogdanowicz, OP

*Eucharistic & Marian Revival Speaker*

Dominican Sisters of Mary, Mother of the Eucharist

4597 Warren Rd., Ann Arbor, MI. 48105

---

## Public Comment for Ann Arbor Township October 1, Meeting

---

From Tom Bartoshesky <tabartoshesky@gmail.com>

Date Wed 10/1/2025 11:50 AM

To Trustees <trustees@aatwp.org>; Diane O'Connell <supervisor@aatwp.org>; Clerk <clerk@aatwp.org>

I ask that these comments be summarized and presented at the October 1, 2025 public input session and incorporated into the minutes.

These comments are from Tom Bartoshesky, residing at 3909 Earhart Road, Ann Arbor MI 48105.

Thank you to the Board of Trustees for your efforts. These comments are not personal attacks on your intentions or character. I know you are dedicated conscientious representatives working to protect and preserve the rural nature and quality of life we all share and expect in Ann Arbor Township. I recognize that you are also Ann Arbor Township citizens, most with full-time jobs in addition to serving as our Trustees and that you are battling a multi-layered corporation with vast resources who have been down this road (with noisy trucks) many times.

As you know this is a critical issue to the citizens of Ann Arbor Township. The mine's actions impact our safety, health, quality of life and financial wellbeing. This is not a time to tread lightly. There are major omissions and deficiencies in the revised preliminary CUP agreement presented by the Township. In general, the agreement is deficient in detailing monitoring, enforcement and penalties for violations.

Any new agreement should have the following priorities:

1. Protect our wells and ground water quality
2. Protect and preserve the natural beauty and rural nature of our Township
3. Maintain the safety of our Residents and Visitors.

Specifically, the CUP 2 as published does not prohibit the Pitt from applying for a haul route that would result in paving Earhart Road. CUP1 states:

F. Applicant represents to the Township that for the duration of any conditional use permit granted by the Township, Applicant will use Earhart Road consistent with, in accordance with the regulations of, and under the limits of, a Normal Route, sometimes referred to as a "Class B," or medium volume" road under the Washtenaw County Road Commission ("WCRC") Procedures & Regulations for Permit Activities, meaning that no improvements will be required by WCRC to comply with a "Designated Route" and/ or "Class A" road requirements. The Applicant represents that it will not seek a designated haul route permit from the WCRC to increase the number of trips or to allow for heavier loads for the duration of this CUP without first requesting an amendment to the CUP to allow for same.

Allowing Earhart to be paved is not consistent with the Masterplan that states: "Existing residential areas should be protected from potentially adverse impacts of incompatible development, such as unreasonable increases in traffic, activity, or excessive noise and light."

Paving Earhart would result in 60 significant (18" to 3 ft diameter) beautiful Maples, Oaks, Shaggy Bark Hickory and Black Walnuts being removed just from my property on one side of Earhart. To widen Earhart from M14 to Joy would eliminate a minimum of 8 times that number of trees (480 trees). Speeds would increase and safety would decline.

Please maintain the no haul route restriction that was in the initial CUP and previously agreed to by the Pitt.

Sincerely,

Tom Bartoshesky

--

Tom Bartoshesky  
(734) 276-2260

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of Ann Arbor Charter Township. DO NOT click on links or open attachments unless you were expecting the email, recognize the sender, and know the content is safe.

---

## Stakeholder Input for Meeting Oct. 1 (Re: Vella Pit)

---

From ingwiemer@aol.com <ingwiemer@aol.com>

Date Mon 9/29/2025 7:40 AM

To Trustees <trustees@aatwp.org>

Dear AATWP Trustees: Since our family is unable to attend the meeting re: MMM/Vella Pit on October 1, 2025, I ask that these comments be publicly summarized at the input session, then incorporated into the minutes for the public session.

The settlement documents that have been posted on the AATWP website raise a lot of concerns for our family, along with skepticism and disappointment.

AATWP's line, "This submission from MMM is a major step toward resolution..." Unless we are missing something, MMM has not taken a major step toward *anything*. Submitting a renewal application and supporting documents is mandatory to continue operations. They should have submitted this months ago when their prior one expired. This isn't above and beyond, it should be deemed late. Their original permit should not have been stayed, their operations should have ceased pending on-going violations and approval of the renewal form.

The settlement proposal fails to mention monetary compensation for AATWP and neighbors for the harmful effects caused by the Pit, its adverse impact on home and property values, and the extensive amount of time and effort residents have had to devote to holding MMM accountable.

As for our home and property values, MMM's negligent operations lead to multiple press releases and an abundance of online information about wells drying up, pollution spewing into lake beds, excessive noise, dirt, etc. This surely discourages many (if not most) people from buying in our neighborhood, at least until problems are resolved.

If you ask ChatGPT for input on our home values, this pops up:

### **Potential impacts & concerns specific to Vella Pit that might affect real estate**

- The Vella Pit has been controversial due to environmental concerns, especially related to the aquifer, dewatering, and impacts on wells in the area. [Reddit+2Reddit+2](#)
- There are ongoing legal, regulatory, and planning-process actions and negotiations (e.g. conditional use permits, reclamation plans, court orders) dealing with how operations at the Vella Pit are constrained. [AATWP+1](#)
- These issues can affect home values (negatively or with uncertainty) for people close by, depending on how severe the impacts are (water, noise, traffic, etc.), how far from the pit they are, whether there are buffers, etc.

ChatGPT also references this study:

A 2015 case in **Richland Township, Michigan** found homes within ½ mile of a gravel mine sold for **up to 30% less** than comparable properties further away. Nearby property owners successfully argued against mine expansion using appraisals and real estate sales data. Other Michigan townships have used property depreciation as a factor in zoning or conditional-use permit denials.

Also, The University of Wisconsin and Center for Rural Studies (2014), Appraisal Institute case studies, and county-level assessments in states like Michigan, Texas, and Wisconsin demonstrated the following:

**Home value decreases of 20-30% if 0-0.5 miles from mine, decreases of 10-20% of 0.5-1.0 miles from mine, and 5-10% decreases if 1-2 miles from mine. These percentages are likely an underestimate since these stats apply to mines that use lawful practices.**

Of course, many people bought their properties knowing they were close to an aggregate mine. There are a few exceptions like our land (directly across from the mine entrance on Earhart) that our ancestors purchased in 1895.

Regardless of purchase date, the mine's relentless expansion, permitted and unpermitted, has ramped up the adverse effects greatly. We, as residents of the former mine, did not expect such a dramatic turn. My family has been directly harmed by falling property values.

In the Settlement renewal, MMM wrote the following about the impact on home values: "Potential impacts on property values were evaluated in the 2020 CUP Application, which indicated that "The proposed use is consistent with the current use and past use for several decades," and **"being consistent with decades of use, the proposed use will preserve and not negatively impact property values."**

**Are they joking? This is a lie, intended to mislead.** MMM's production rates are nowhere near where they were decades ago. They are exponentially higher and their mining practices more negligent.

And, it's pointless for AATWP to write in the "following conditions to future mining operations" when most of them are already in effect and Trustees are unable and/or unwilling to hold them accountable. Seems like more of same.

And, what exactly does "the Township could take enforceable action" mean? This area is an opportunity to spell out exactly what can happen (e.g., a complete shutdown).

Also deeply troubling is the repeated line, "Water quality sampling is not applicable to this CUP renewal application." The renewal application is a poor 'cut-and-paste' job at best. It should not be truncated. In fact, it should be more detailed than the first one since they obviously tried to hide behind huge voids of information in the first one.

In the original CUP, MMM/Ajax had to place funds in a retainer (escrow) account to apply toward reclamation. This amount needs to be doubled since we do not know how many toxins and other harmful effects will need expert remediation after their decimation.

**Where does the settlement agreement state an increase in escrow funds for reclamation since the original amount will surely be insufficient to bring the property to acceptable standards for community development?**

As far as the term of a renewed CUP, six to eight years to reclaim the peaceful, rural atmosphere, restore damage to the environment (where even possible), or sell our properties at the price point they deserve is too long.

This is beyond ridiculous at this point. Our family and our neighbors need to reclaim their lives, not spend the next 5-6 years doing the jobs that elected officials should be doing. We strongly urge you to take a stand against MMM. You hold all the cards, not them.

In summary:

- Include a monetary settlement for property owners for depreciation (use the research data above to calculate acceptable amounts), and for those who suffered well disruptions, extremes in water levels, toxins, etc. and for expending countless hours of their personal time to combat this fiasco.

- Raise the escrow amount for reclamation
- Suspend ALL operations until 100% of the violations have been remediated
- Demand accurate data and scientifically valid studies.
- LISTEN to my neighbors! **I give them permission to speak on my behalf.** They have been excellent and vigilant fiduciaries of our community. Respect their data and their input.

Sincerely, Ingrid Wiemer (co-owner of the property directly across from the mine entrance)

Parcel #: I-09-02-100-015, 847-372-0570, [ingwiemer@aol.com](mailto:ingwiemer@aol.com)

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of Ann Arbor Charter Township. DO NOT click on links or open attachments unless you were expecting the email, recognize the sender, and know the content is safe.

## Special Township Meeting 10/1

Comments: Kay Yourist

4125 Earhart Road

The water issue is not simply one of have our wells recovered? It also is an issue of water quality. Numerous residents have documented serious water quality issues. Two that we are personally experiencing with our water: increased particles and foul odor. We need a clear and concise procedure for these water quality issues to be reported and mitigated by MMM; they replaced our well when it went dry but who do Susan and I go to now that we have foul smelling water with a high particle count that we cannot drink and only use when we must? How do we get reimbursement for the costly water filtration system we now need to install in our home? For the expensive maintenance this system will require indefinitely?

All aspects of the restoration of Massey Lake and the wetlands must be clearly defined. A reclamation plan MUST include citizen input and participation before settled on.

Settlement terms MUST include a reduction in the outrageous number of trucks their expired CUP allows. Truck counts need to be strengthened, not weakened - we need daily, weekly and monthly counts so the math is transparent. And settlement terms must include the stipulation that MMM cannot and will not request that neither Earhart Road, Warren Road and/or Joy Road be classified as a "haul route." We ALL must do absolutely everything we can to support the Ann Arbor Township master plan of protecting the rural nature and beauty of our area. This mining operation will be gone one day but we and generations to come will be left with the devastating changes they have caused.

